



**CIVILIAN POLICE REVIEW BOARD
OFFICE OF PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS**

December 10, 2019

MEETING MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER – 10:06

Michael Graham, Chairperson

II. ROLL CALL

Chairperson Graham

CPRB MEMBERS

ATTENDANCE

Michael Graham, Chair
Ken Mountcastle
Michael Hess
Ernest Turner
Dave Gatian
March Clark
Roz Quarto – excused absence
Ashley Mostella – excused absence
Gerri Butler, Staff Counsel
LeeAnn Hanlon, Secretary

OPS STAFF

ATTENDANCE

Roger Smith, Administrator
George Coulter, General Manager
Henry Roney, Senior Investigator
Spyridon Kodellas, Research Analyst
Art Bowker, Investigator
Kevin Wynne, Investigator
Barbara Williams-Bennett, Investigator
Anitra Merritt, Investigator
David Hammons, Investigator
Eric Richardson, Investigator
Julie Delaney, Investigator
Anitra Merritt, Investigator

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

IV. PUBLIC COMMENT

V. SUBPOENA

Roger Smith, Administrator

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE DIMISSAL APPEAL

Administrator Smith

VII. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS

Administrator Smith

VIII. HILLARD HEINTZE CASES

Administrator Smith

IX. HILLARD HEINTZE FINDINGS LETTERS

Administrator Smith

X. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

XI. OPS REPORT

Administrator Smith

A. REVIEW OF CDP DISCIPLINARY DECISIONS

XII. POLICY UPDATES

XIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

XIV. NEW BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

Next Meeting Date: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 at 10:00 am



III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Hess made a motion to approve the minutes. Motion seconded by Mr. Turner and passed.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENT – Mr. Graham reminded everyone of the three (3) minute time limit.

Dave Lima, SURJ –

I've commented previously about the components of an effective police oversight system (Independence, Authority and Funding) that is both respected by the police department and trusted by the community. Last month I focused on two authority measures that could be employed within the system to enhance its effectiveness. Today I want to focus on independence.

The most critical component of an independent review board is in the selection of its memberships. The legitimacy of the board is enhanced when a majority of the board is nominated by civic organizations that have an interest in the safety of the city and in the civil rights of community members. The selection of a minority of the board would remain with the mayor and the council. Changing the selection process would help to ensure the independence of the board.

Nominees to the board should have expertise in a relevant field in order to be appointed, such as a legal, civil rights, or law enforcement background. The nominees should have a demonstrated commitment to the well-being of the city where they live and a strong understanding of the importance of upholding civil rights and civil liberties in policing. They should also believe in a police department that operates in a transparent and accountable manner. No member of the board should be a current or former employee of the police department that the board oversees, and a majority of the board members should not have a law enforcement background.

Building an effective civilian review board is no easy task. It requires a groundswell of community support. It also helps to have a willing mayor, city council, and police chief. And it takes money and time to get it right. Selecting a majority of board members from civic organizations would be a step in the right direction, a step toward getting it right.



VII. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS

a. 18-188: Henigham

P.O. Rice #1886

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Gatian
Second: Graham
Motion passes

P.O. Lewis #2054

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Gatian
Second: Graham
Motion passes

Sgt. Hayes #9188

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Gatian
Second: Graham
Motion passes

b. 19-063: Logan

P.O. Kern #1612

Allegation: Excessive Force
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes



P.O. Glass #332

Allegation: Excessive Force
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes

c. 19-069: Quintana

P.O. McLaughlin #1394

Allegation: Improper Procedure
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Gatian
Second: Turner
Motion passes

P.O. New #667

Allegation: Improper Procedure
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Gatian
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

d. 19-088: Manley

Det. White #1830

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes

Next Meeting Date: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 at 10:00 am



e. 19-126: Ortiz

Lt. Strong #8528

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Graham
Second: Hess
Motion passes

f. 19-135: Clemons

Sgt. Treece #9218

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Graham
Second: Hess
Motion passes

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes

g. 19-136: Logan

P.O. Randolph #2372

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Turner
Motion passes



P.O. Kiesner #1620

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes

h. 19-155 Korecky

Det. Orr #2320

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Turner
Motion passes

i. 19-178: Torres

P.O. Zak #1046

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes



VI. HILLARD HEINTZE CASES – Mr. Graham makes a motion that the recommendations of the HH Cases be accepted by the Board, with the modification that all recommendations be changed to INSUFFICIENT EVIDENCE. Motion seconded by Mr. Gatian, motion passes. The Board accepted the modified HH recommendations for the following cases:

- 16-069: Keyes
- 16-170: Nichols
- 16-205: Ogletree
- 17-112: Melson
- 17-120: Pringle
- 17-121: Bryant
- 17-123: Gibson
- 17-127: Ector
- 17-134: Ingram
- 17-142: Williams-Dorsey
- 17-150: Lathon
- 17-158: Hayes
- 17-161: Mumphrey
- 17-186: Robinson
- 17-188: Goon
- 17-192: Dayem
- 17-195: Griffin
- 17-196: Koren
- 17-198: Ventresca
- 17-202: Board
- 17-208: Henry
- 17-231: Okpala



VII. HILLARD HEINTZE FINDINGS LETTERS

a. 16-193: Mitchell

Det. Adams #12

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct

Recommendation: Sustained

Motion: Graham

Second: Turner

Motion passes

b. 17-062: Campbell

P.O. Hejny #647

Allegation: WCS Violation

Recommendation: Administratively Closed

Motion: Graham

Second: Hess

Motion passes

c. 17-066: Graves

P.O. Daugenti #1736

Allegation: Harassment

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Graham

Second: Gatian

Motion passes

Allegation: Improper Citation

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Graham

Second: Gatian

Motion passes



P.O. Harrigan #1085

Allegation: Harassment
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes

Allegation: Improper Citation
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes with one opposed

d. 17-071: Thaker

P.O. Barnett #2119

Allegation: Illegal Parking
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes with two opposed

e. 17-089: Reid

P.O. Tomaro #624

Allegation: Improper Arrest
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes



Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes

f. 17-096: Crain

Det. Howard #2205

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes

g. 17-103: Muniz

P.O. Majid #777

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes with one opposed

h. 17-128: Brevdigam

P.O. Webb #2064

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Gatian
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

Next Meeting Date: Tuesday, January 14, 2020 at 10:00 am



P.O. Valencic #2091

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Sustained
Motion: Gatian
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

i. 17-162: Barnes

P.O. Jagoe #509

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

j. 17-172: Meade

P.O. Boddy #1095

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes

P.O. Mariani #1614

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence
Motion: Graham
Second: Mountcastle
Motion passes



k. 17-194: Pursel

P.O. Rodes #2126

Allegation: Unprofessional Conduct

Recommendation: Sustained

Motion: Graham

Second: Gatian

Motion passes

l. 17-209: Burrage

P.O. Hourihan #250

Allegation: Improper Citation

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Graham

Second: Clark

Motion passes with one abstention

Allegation: Improper Arrest

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Graham

Second: Clark

Motion passes with one opposed and one abstention

Allegation: Improper Search

Recommendation: Sustained

Motion: Graham

Second: Mountcastle

Motion passes with one abstention

P.O. Pollack #769

Allegation: Improper Citation

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Graham

Second: Clark

Motion passes with one abstention



Allegation: Improper Arrest
Recommendation: Exonerated
Motion: Graham
Second: Clark
Motion passes with one opposed and one abstention

Allegation: Improper Search
Recommendation: Unfounded
Motion: Graham
Second: Gatian
Motion passes with one abstention

IX (A). REVIEW OF CDP DECISIONS

15-028: Lopez	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams
15-180: Brown	CPRB disagreed with Chief Williams' decision and moved to appeal this decision with Safety Director McGrath.
17-065: Kavouras	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams
17-070: Rubesne	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams
17-083: Chubbs	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams
18-126: Rhoades	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams
18-142: DeFrank-Jenne	CPRB accepted the decision of Chief Williams.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting adjourned at 13:01 hours.