



Civilian Police Review Board Agenda

Special Virtual Meeting

Tuesday, June 17th, 2025

Billy Sharp, Chair

Kristen Traxler, Interim Administrator

**Civilian Police Review Board &
Office of Professional Standards**

205 West St. Clair, 3rd Floor

Cleveland, Ohio 44113

www.clevelandohio.gov/ops

CIVILIAN POLICE REVIEW BOARD
MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

Billy Sharp, Chair

Brandon Brown, Vice Chair

David Gatian, Board Member

Sherall E. Hardy, Board Member

Kenneth Mountcastle, Board Member

Chenoa C. Miller, Board Member

Diana Cyganovich, Board Member

Glenn Parker III, Board Member

SPECIAL VIRTUAL MEETING NOTICE & AGENDA

The Civilian Police Review Board will hold a public meeting at the following date
and time:

Tuesday, June 17th, 2025 at 0900 am

THS SPECIAL MEETING WILL BE HELD VIRTUALLY

You can view the meeting via YouTube:

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCjvji5gYnraY74Emrj6N5wg>

Tuesday, June 17th, 2025

SPECIAL VIRTUAL MEETING AGENDA

I. CALL TO ORDER

Billy Sharp, Chair

- Roll Call

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

Billy Sharp, Chair

- Citizens who intend on making a public comment are afforded 3 minutes to do so

III. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS

Kristen Traxler
Interim Administrator

IV. EXECUTIVE SESSION

CPRB

- Motion for executive session for personnel, employment and discipline matters will be considered
- Vote to adjourn back into open session

V. OPS STATUS REPORT

Kristen Traxler
Interim Administrator

- OPS and CPRB Seals

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Brandon Brown,
Vice Chair

- Scheduling virtual CPRB meetings for July, August & September 2025

VII. OLD BUSINESS

Billy Sharp, Chair

- Salary Adjustments
- NACOLE Registration

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS

Tabled Cases

LAST HEARD	OPS#	COMPLAINANT	INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION	CPRB DISPOSITION
05/13/2025	2022-0158	Sutton	Ouk	Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service <i>Board agreed to table the case so the Investigator get the rational from the Officers as to why all the witness statements weren't included and also additional information on the reporting requirements. The motion to table the case was made by Brandon Brown and Second by Diana Cyganovich.</i>	P.O. Derrick Brown, #713 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:</i> P.O. Seth Mercer, #868 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:</i>

New Cases

#	OPS#	COMPLAINANT	INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION	CPRB DISPOSITION
1	2024-0282	CPRB	Green	Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service	P.O. Jason Hyrn, #578 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:</i>
2	2023-0173	Joseph Westfall	Green	Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023)	P.O. Ryan Krantz, #1734 Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:</i> P.O. Martin Richardson-Liberan, #1169 Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED

					<p><i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Frank Garmback IV, #394 Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>Sgt. Michelle Gricar, #9262 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (04/01/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Michael Valdez, #1384 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (04/01/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Stephanie Martinez, #1548 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (04/01/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Anthony Estremera, #799 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (04/01/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>Det. Zachary Banks, #645 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (04/01/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
--	--	--	--	--	--

3	2022-0154	Emily Calmino	Green	<p>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</p> <p>Allegation B: Lack of Service</p> <p>Allegation C: Bias Policing</p>	<p>P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation B: Lack of Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
4	2022-0050	Nehemiah Jackson	Ouk	<p>Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service</p> <p>Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</p> <p>Allegation C: Bias Policing</p>	<p>P.O. Taylor Cunningham, #1218 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Scott Floyd, #514 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. James Huskey Jr., #2121 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: ADMINISTRATIVELY DISMISSED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. James Huskey Jr., #2121 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: ADMINISTRATIVELY DISMISSED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i></p>

					<p><i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Taylor Cunningham, #1218 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Scott Floyd, #514 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
5	2023-0051	Nehemiah Jackson	Ouk	<p>Allegation A: Lack of Service</p> <p>Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</p>	<p>P.O. Antwuan Wells, #1330 Allegation A: Lack of Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Antwuan Wells, #1330 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
6	2022-0303	Alfred Roque	Szymanski	<p>Allegation A: Improper Procedure: Stop</p> <p>Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search</p>	<p>P.O. Robert Bjekic, #693 Allegation A: Improper Procedure: Stop OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Kirstein Beringuel, #691 Allegation A: Improper Procedure: Stop OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Robert Bjekic, #693 Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>

					<p>P.O. Kirstein Beringuel, #691 Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>Sgt. Hignio Rivera, #9246 Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
7	2023-0095	Daniel Moore	Szymanski	<p>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</p>	<p>Sgt. Robert Goines, #9215 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Samuel Ortiz Jr., #1694 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Kraig Novak, #1244 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Denzel Jones, #990 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Luis Flores-Galarza, #800 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i></p>

					<p><i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Jason Santana, #2012 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Cory Beckwith, #1363 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Zachary Musarra, #2133 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Failure to Provide Name and Badge</p> <p>Sgt. Robert Goines, #9215 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Kraig Novak, #1244 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Luis Flores-Galarza, #800 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Samuel Ortiz Jr., #1694</p>
--	--	--	--	--	---

					<p>Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Denzel Jones, #990 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Jason Santana, #2012 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Cory Beckwith, #1363 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>P.O. Zachary Musarra, #2133 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>
8	2024-0029	Tiffany Allen	Eisen	Allegation A: Harassment	<p>P.O. Karli Ayers, #635 Allegation A: Harassment OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p> <p>Det. Richard Adams, #12 Allegation A: Harassment OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i></p>

				Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	P.O. Karli Ayers, #635 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i> Det. Richard Adams, #12 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i>
9	2024-0070	Wilhelmina Huff	Khabir	Allegation A: Improper Procedure	Sgt. Andre Bays, #9300 Allegation A: Improper Procedure OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i> Sgt. Randolph Murphy, #9286 Allegation A: Improper Procedure OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i> <i>Second:</i> <i>Motion Status:</i>

Departure(s) from the Chief or Director

#	OPS#	CMP.	INVEST.	RECOMMENDATION	CHIEF'S DECISION
1	2023-0232	Anthony Phillips	Funari	<i>Date Heard by CPRB: 12/10/2024</i> Det. Melvin Gonzalez #1150 <i>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</i> <i>CPRB Recommendation: Sustained</i> Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, were notified twice that the alleged suspect in this incident was Gerald Toney according to the victim who stated he was her ex. However, you still continued to pursue Anthony Phillips as the suspect in this case.	Date Heard by Chief: 05/02/2025 Det. Melvin Gonzalez #1150 <i>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</i> <i>Chief Departure Recommendation: Dismissed</i> Because the record contains insufficient evidence to support a finding of guilty as it pertains to you intentionally having the complainant charged and continually pursuing that charge, I depart from the Civilian Police Review Board's finding for

			<p>You had the knowledge of two possible names. You intentionally continued to pursue Anthony Phillips and not bother to cross check both names and search for any previous incidents at the same location which would have indicated that Gerald Toney and the victim had previous encounters of similarity at the same location of the case prior to this one. The CPRB determined this behavior of continually pursuing charges against Mr. Phillips, without confirming the suspect, was unprofessional conduct and was intentional, violating Manual of Rules 3.12. (Group III Violation)”</p> <p><i>Allegation B: Lack of Service- No Service</i> <i>CPRB Recommendation: Sustained</i> Per the CDP Disposition Letter, “The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Lack of Service violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, followed up on a burglary report investigation completed by Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, and failed to thoroughly investigate the two different names you obtained when you reviewed the report naming Anthony Phillips as the named suspect and learning the name Gerald Toney when you interviewed the victim in this case. The victim provided you the name of her ex, Gerald Toney, twice as the suspect in this encounter. Subsequently, Mr. Phillips was wrongfully charged and an arrest arraignment was scheduled due to the lack of service during the follow up investigation. Because you did not take the time to correctly identify Gerald Toney as the named suspect in this matter you failed to provide sufficient service in your investigation into the crime, violating Manual of Rules 4.01, 4.03 and 4.18. (Group I Violation)”</p> <p><i>Additional Recommended Allegation C: Improper Procedure</i> <i>CPRB Recommendation: Sustained</i> Per the CDP Disposition Letter, “The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Improper Procedure violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, issued a false summons arraignment</p>	<p>Specification #2. Based on the foregoing, I “Dismiss” Specification #2.</p>
--	--	--	--	---

				<p>for Anthony Phillips. You obtained a summons for an arraignment for Anthony Phillips that was based on invalid information that you should have been able to cross reference in the database and would have found the records of Gerald Toney associated at the same address and location, along with the same victim in this matter that occurred as recently as 3-4 weeks prior to this incident. You failed to obtain a valid summons. Therefore, this action was an improper procedure. You also did not obtain a statement from Anthony Phillips, violating the Cleveland Division of Police Detective Unit Manual. (Group I Violation)”</p> <p>P.O. Mason Swires #2383 <i>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</i> <i>CPRB Recommendation: Sustained</i> Per the CDP Disposition Letter, “The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct violation is sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, were notified twice that the alleged suspect in this incident was Gerald Toney according to the victim who stated he was her ex at the scene. With this knowledge, and after dispatch provided the name Anthony Phillips associated with the information provided to dispatch, you still wrote up this report indicating Anthony Phillips as the named suspect and did not bother to cross reference both names and search for any previous incidents at the same location. The CPRB determined this behavior of leaving Mr. Phillips on the report as the named suspect was intentional, resulting in unprofessional behavior, violating Manual of Rules 3.12. (Group III Violation)”</p> <p><i>Allegation B: Lack of Service- No Service</i> <i>CPRB Recommendation: Sustained</i> Per the CDP Disposition Letter, “The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Lack of Service violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, failed to thoroughly investigate the two different</p>	<p>P.O. Mason Swires #2383 <i>Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct</i> <i>Chief Departure</i> <i>Recommendation: Dismissed</i> The record contains insufficient evidence to support a finding of guilt as it pertains to you intentionally completing the report with the incorrect named suspect. Because you checked with Cleveland Police Radio in an effort to rectify the discrepancy in the name provided by Cleveland Police Radio, I depart from the Civilian Police Review Board’s finding for Specification #2. Based on the foregoing, I “Dismiss” Specification #2.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	---

				names you obtained when you responded to a burglary call for service. The victim provided you the name of her ex, Gerald Toney, as the suspect in this encounter. Dispatch provided the name Anthony Phillips. You completed the named suspect report identifying Anthony Phillips as the named suspect even after the victim stated to you it was Gerald Toney. Subsequently, Mr. Phillips was wrongfully charged and an arrest arraignment was scheduled due to the lack of service during the initial response. Because you did not take the time to correctly identify Gerald Toney as the named suspect in this matter, you failed to provide sufficient service in your initial response to the burglary, violating Manual of Rules 4.01, 4.03 and 4.18. (Group I Violation)”	
--	--	--	--	---	--

Statistics on Cases for June 17th, 2025 Meeting

INVESTIGATION STATUS:	
Abridged:	5
Standard:	4
Complex:	0
ALLEGATIONS (Total):	61
Harassment:	2
Excessive Force:	0
Lack of Service:	21
Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct:	12
Bias Policing:	3
WCS Violation:	0
IMPROPER PROCEDURE:	2
Improper Citations	0
Improper Search	3
Improper Stop	2
Improper Tow	0
Improper Arrest	0
Improper Warrant	0
Improper Collection of Evidence	0
PROPERTY:	
Missing Property	0
Damage to Property	0