

# Civilian Police Review Board Agenda

Tuesday, June 10<sup>th</sup>, 2025 Billy Sharp, Chair

Kristen Traxler, Interim Administrator
Civilian Police Review Board &
Office of Professional Standards

205 West St. Clair, 3rd Floor Cleveland, Ohio 44113

www.clevelandohio.gov/ops

D. . . 1 . f 16

# CIVILIAN POLICE REVIEW BOARD MEMBERS OF THE BOARD

Billy Sharp, Chair

Brandon Brown, Vice Chair

David Gatian, Board Member

Sherall E. Hardy, Board Member

Kenneth Mountcastle, Board Member

Chenoa C. Miller, Board Member

Diana Cyganovich, Board Member

Glenn Parker III, Board Member

#### **MEETING NOTICE & AGENDA**

The Civilian Police Review Board will hold a public meeting at the following date and time:

Tuesday, June  $10^{th}$ , 2025 at 0900 am

THE MEETING WILL BE HELD IN PERSON AT CLEVELAND CITY HALL 601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 514

You can view the meeting via YouTube:

https/www.youtube.com/channel/UCjvji5gYnraY74Emrj6N5wg

# Tuesday, June 10th, 2025

#### **MEETING AGENDA**

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Billy Sharp, Chair

• Roll Call

#### II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**CPRB** 

#### III. PUBLIC COMMENT

Billy Sharp, Chair

 Citizens who intend on making a public comment are afforded 3 minutes to do so

#### IV. TRAINING SESSION

Sgt. John Ball

WCS Training

Mobile Support Unit **Deputy Chief Jarod** 

**Schlacht** 

Chief of Staff, CDP

# V. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS WITH CITIZENS OR CDP SUBJECT EMPLOYEE PRESENT

Kristen Traxler

Interim Administrator

- Complainants are afforded 4 minutes to make a statement after the case has been presented to the CPRB.
- CDP subject employees are afforded 4 minutes to make a statement after the case has been presented to the CPRB.

#### VI. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS

Kristen Traxler

Interim Administrator

#### VII. EXECUTIVE SESSION

**CPRB** 

- Motion for executive session for personnel, employment and discipline matters will be considered
- Vote to adjourn back into open session

#### VIII. OPS STATUS REPORT

Kristen Traxler

• OPS and CPRB Seals

Interim Administrator

#### IX. NEW BUSINESS

• Scheduling virtual CPRB meetings for July, August & September 2025 Brandon Brown, Vice Chair

#### X. OLD BUSINESS

- Salary Adjustments
- NACOLE Registration

#### XI. ADJOURNMENT

#### Billy Sharp, Chair

# **PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS**

## **Tabled Cases**

LAST	OPS#	COMPLAINANT	INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION	CPRB DISPOSITION
HEARD					
05/13/2025	2022-0158	Sutton	Ouk	Allegation A:	P.O. Derrick Brown,
				Lack of Service: No	#713
				Service	Allegation A: Lack of
					Service: No Service
				Board agreed to table	OPS Recommendation:
				the case so the	EXONERATED
				Investigator get the	CPRB Motion:
				rational from the	Second:
				Officers as to why all the	Motion Status:
				witness statements	
				weren't included and	P.O. Seth Mercer, #868
				also additional	Allegation A: Lack of
				information on the	Service: No Service
				reporting requirements.	OPS Recommendation:
				The motion to table the	EXONERATED
				case was made by	CPRB Motion:
				Brandon Brown and	Second:
				Second by Diana	Motion
				Cyganovich.	Status:

## New Cases

#	OPS#	COMPLAINANT	INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION	CPRB DISPOSITION
1	2024-0130	Anonymous	Bowker	Allegation A: Improper Procedure (Manual Rules)	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation A: Improper Procedure (Manual Rules) OPS Recommendation: SUSTAINED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation B: Improper Procedure (GPO 4.01.01)	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation B: Improper Procedure (GPO 4.01.01) OPS Recommendation: SUSTAINED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation C: Improper Procedure	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation C: Improper Procedure

				(GPO 4.06.04)	(GPO 4.06.04) OPS Recommendation: SUSTAINED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation D: Improper Procedure (GPO 4.06.01)	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation D: Improper Procedure (GPO 4.06.01) OPS Recommendation: SUSTAINED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation E: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct (Manual of Rules 5.01 & GPO 1.01.03)	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation E: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct (Manual of Rules 5.01 & GPO 1.01.03) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation F: Improper Procedure (GPO 8.1.01)	P.O. Demetrius G Woods, #2127 Allegation F: Improper Procedure (GPO 8.1.01) OPS Recommendation: SUSTAINED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
2	2024-0282	CPRB	Green	Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service	P.O. Jason Hyrn, #578 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
3	2023-0173	Joseph Westfall	Green	Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023)	P.O. Ryan Krantz, #1734 Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  P.O. Martin Richardson-Liberan,
					#1169 Allegation A: Lack of Service: Insufficient Service (03/28/2023) OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion:

P.O. Frank Garmback IV Allegation A: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (03/28/20) OPS Recommendation: UN CPRB Motion:	ice:
P.O. Frank Garmback IV Allegation A: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (03/28/20) OPS Recommendation: UN CPRB Motion:	ice:
Allegation A: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (03/28/2009) OPS Recommendation: UN CPRB Motion:	ice:
Insufficient Service (03/28/2009) OPS Recommendation: UN CPRB Motion:	
OPS Recommendation: UN  CPRB Motion:	2023)
Second:	
Motion Status:	
Allegation B: Sgt. Michelle Gricar, #926	
Lack of Service: Allegation B: Lack of Service Insufficient Service (04/01/2012)	
Service OPS Recommendation: UN	
(04/01/2023) CPRB Motion: Second:	
Motion Status:	
P.O. Michael Valdez, #138	
Allegation B: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (04/01/2	
OPS Recommendation: UN	IFOUNDED
CPRB Motion: Second:	
Motion Status:	
P.O. Stephanie Martinez,	
Allegation B: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (04/01/2	
OPS Recommendation: UN  CPRB Motion:	IFOUNDED
Second:	
Motion Status:	
P.O. Anthony Estremera,	
Allegation B: Lack of Servi Insufficient Service (04/01/2	(2023)
OPS Recommendation: UN  CPRB Motion:	IFOUNDED
Second:	
Motion Status:	
Det. Zachary Banks, #645 Allegation B: Lack of Servi	
Insufficient Service (04/01/	(2023)
OPS Recommendation: UN  CPRB Motion:	IFOUNDED
Second:	
Motion Status:	

4	2022-0154	Emily Calmino	Green	Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation B: Lack of Service	P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation B: Lack of Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation C: Bias Policing	P.O. Robquetta Lavender, #2594 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
5	2022-0050	Nehemiah Jackson	Ouk	Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service	P.O. Taylor Cunningham, #1218 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
					P.O. Scott Floyd, #514 Allegation A: Lack of Service: No Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	P.O. James Huskey Jr., #2121 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: ADMINISTRATIVELY DISMISSED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation C: Bias Policing	P.O. James Huskey Jr., #2121 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: ADMINISTRATIVELY DISMISSED CPRB Motion: Second:

					Motion Status:
					P.O. Taylor Cunningham, #1218 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
					P.O. Scott Floyd, #514 Allegation C: Bias Policing OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
6	2023-0051	Nehemiah Jackson	Ouk	Allegation A: Lack of Service	P.O. Antwuan Wells, #1330 Allegation A: Lack of Service OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
				Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	P.O. Antwuan Wells, #1330 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
7	2022-0090	Darryl Smith	Ouk	Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	P.O. Tyeisha I. Sain, #438 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  P.O. Peter Sains, #497 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion:
				Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search	Second: Motion Status:  P.O. Peter Sains, #497 Allegation B: Improper Procedure: Search OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:

8	2022-0303	Alfred Roque	Szymanski	Allegation A:	P.O. Robert Bjekic, #693
	2022 0303	Timed Roque	22 j iliulibri	Improper	Allegation A: Improper Procedure: Stop
				Procedure: Stop	OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED <i>CPRB Motion:</i>
					Second:
					Motion Status:
					P.O. Kirstein Beringuel, #691
					Allegation A: Improper Procedure: Stop
					OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED
					CPRB Motion: Second:
					Motion Status:
				A11 41 D	DO DI ADILI MOD
				Allegation B: Improper	P.O. Robert Bjekic, #693 Allegation B: Improper Procedure:
				Procedure: Search	Search
					OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED
					CPRB Motion: Second:
					Motion Status:
					P.O. Kirstein Beringuel, #691
					Allegation B: Improper Procedure:
					Search
					OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i>
					Second:
					Motion Status:
					Sgt. Hignio Rivera, #9246
					Allegation B: Improper Procedure:
					Search OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED
					CPRB Motion:
					Second:
9	2023-0095	Daniel Moore	Szymanski	Allegation A:	Motion Status: Sgt. Robert Goines, #9215
	2023-0073	Damiel Wioole	52 y manski	Unprofessional	Allegation A: Unprofessional
				Behavior/Conduct	Behavior/Conduct
					OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i>
					Second:
					Motion Status:
					P.O. Samuel Ortiz Jr., #1694
					Allegation A: Unprofessional
					Behavior/Conduct OPS Pagementation: UNEQUINDED
					OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED <i>CPRB Motion:</i>
					Second:
					Motion Status:

P.O. Kraig Novak, #1244 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct **OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED** CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: P.O. Denzel Jones, #990 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct **OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED** CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: P.O. Luis Flores-Galarza, #800 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct **OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED** CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: P.O. Jason Santana, #2012 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct **OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED** CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: P.O. Cory Beckwith, #1363 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct **OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED** CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: P.O. Zachary Musarra, #2133 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status: **Allegation B:** Sgt. Robert Goines, #9215 **Improper** Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Procedure: Failure Provide Name and Badge

		to Provide Name and Badge	OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  P.O. Kraig Novak, #1244 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
			P.O. Luis Flores-Galarza, #800 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
			P.O. Samuel Ortiz Jr., #1694 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
			P.O. Denzel Jones, #990 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
			P.O. Jason Santana, #2012 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
			P.O. Cory Beckwith, #1363 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:

10	2024-0029	Tiffany Allen	Eisen	Allegation A:	P.O. Zachary Musarra, #2133 Allegation B: Lack of Service: Failure to Provide Name and Badge OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  P.O. Karli Ayers, #635
				Harassment	Allegation A: Harassment OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  Det. Richard Adams, #12 Allegation A: Harassment OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED  CPRB Motion: Second:
				Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct	Motion Status:  P.O. Karli Ayers, #635 Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  Det. Richard Adams, #12
					Allegation B: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct OPS Recommendation: UNFOUNDED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:
11	2024-0070	Wilhelmina Huff	Khabir	Allegation A: Improper Procedure	Sgt. Andre Bays, #9300 Allegation A: Improper Procedure OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status:  Sgt. Randolph Murphy, #9286 Allegation A: Improper Procedure OPS Recommendation: EXONERATED CPRB Motion: Second: Motion Status

## **Departure(s) from the Chief or Director**

#	OPS#	CMP.	INVEST.	RECOMMENDATION	CHIEF'S DECISION
1	2023-0232	Anthony Phillips	Funari	Det. Melvin Gonzalez #1150  Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct CPRB Recommendation: Sustained Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, were notified twice that the alleged suspect in this incident was Gerald Toney according to the victim who stated he was her ex. However, you still continued to pursue Anthony Phillips as the suspect in this case. You had the knowledge of two possible names. You intentionally continued to pursue Anthony Phillips and not bother to cross check both names and search for any previous incidents at the same location which would have indicated that Gerald Toney and the victim had previous encounters of similarity at the same location of the case prior to this one. The CPRB determined this behavior of continually pursuing charges against Mr. Phillips, without confirming the suspect, was unprofessional conduct and was intentional, violating Manual of Rules 3.12. (Group III Violation)"  Allegation B: Lack of Service- No Service CPRB Recommendation: Sustained Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Lack of Service violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, followed up on a burglary report investigation completed by Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, and failed to thoroughly investigate the two different names you obtained when you reviewed the report naming Anthony Phillips as the named suspect and learning the name Gerald Toney when you interviewed the victim in this case. The victim provided you the name of her ex, Gerald Toney, twice as the suspect in this encounter. Subsequently, Mr. Phillips was wrongfully charged and an arrest arraignment	Date Heard by Chief: 05/02/2025  Det. Melvin Gonzalez #1150 Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct Chief Departure Recommendation: Dismissed  Because the record contains insufficient evidence to support a finding of guilty as it pertains to you intentionally having the complainant charged and continually pursuing that charge, I depart from the Civilian Police Review Board's finding for Specification #2. Based on the foregoing, I "Dismiss" Specification #2.

was scheduled due to the lack of service during the follow up investigation. Because you did not take the time to correctly identify Gerald Toney as the named suspect in this matter you failed to provide sufficient service in your investigation into the crime, violating Manual of Rules 4.01, 4.03 and 4.18. (Group I Violation)"

Additional Recommended Allegation C: Improper Procedure

CPRB Recommendation: Sustained

Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Improper Procedure violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that, you, Detective Melvin Gonzalez #1150, issued a false summons arraignment for Anthony Phillips. You obtained a summons for an arraignment for Anthony Phillips that was based on invalid information that you should have been able to cross reference in the database and would have found the records of Gerald Toney associated at the same address and location, along with the same victim in this matter that occurred as recently as 3-4 weeks prior to this incident. You failed to obtain a valid summons. Therefore, this action was an improper procedure. You also did not obtain a statement from Anthony Phillips, violating the Cleveland Division of Police Detective Unit Manual. (Group I Violation)"

#### P.O. Mason Swires #2383

Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct CPRB Recommendation: Sustained

Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending the that allegation of Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct violation is sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, were notified twice that the alleged suspect in this incident was Gerald Toney according to the victim who stated he was her ex at the scene. With this knowledge, and after dispatch provided the name Anthony Phillips associated with the information provided to dispatch, you still wrote up this report indicating Anthony Phillips as the named suspect and did not bother to cross reference both names and search for any previous incidents at the same location. The CPRB determined this behavior of leaving Mr. Phillips on the report as the named suspect intentional, resulting

#### P.O. Mason Swires #2383

Allegation A: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct Chief *Departure* Recommendation: Dismissed The contains record insufficient evidence support a finding of guilt as it pertains to you intentionally completing the report with the suspect. incorrect named Because you checked with Cleveland Police Radio in an effort to rectify the discrepancy in the name provided by Cleveland Police Radio, I depart from the Civilian Police Review Board's finding for Specification #2. Based on the foregoing, I "Dismiss"

unprofessional behavior, violating Manual of Specification #2. Rules 3.12. (Group III Violation)"

Allegation B: Lack of Service- No Service CPRB Recommendation: Sustained

Per the CDP Disposition Letter, "The Civilian Police Review Board (CPRB) is recommending that the allegation of Lack of Service violation be sustained. The CPRB asserts that on April 17, 2023, you, Patrol Officer Mason Swires #2383, failed to thoroughly investigate the two different names you obtained when you responded to a burglary call for service. The victim provided you the name of her ex, Gerald Toney, as the suspect in this encounter. Dispatch provided the name Anthony Phillips. You completed the named suspect report identifying Anthony Phillips as the named suspect even after the victim stated to you it was Gerald Toney. Subsequently, Mr. Phillips was wrongfully charged and an arrest arraignment was scheduled due to the lack of service during the initial response. Because you did not take the time to correctly identify Gerald Toney as the named suspect in this matter, you failed to provide sufficient service in your initial response to the burglary, violating Manual of Rules 4.01, 4.03 and 4.18. (Group I Violation)"

#### Statistics on Cases for June 10th, 2025 Meeting

TATE TO COMPANY OF A DESCRIPTION OF A DE	
INVESTIGATION STATUS:	
Abridged:	5
Standard:	6
Complex:	0
ALLEGATIONS (Total):	61
Harassment:	2
Excessive Force:	0
Lack of Service:	21
Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct:	15
Bias Policing:	3
WCS Violation:	0
IMPROPER PROCEDURE:	7
Improper Citations	0
Improper Search	4
Improper Stop	2
Improper Tow	0
Improper Arrest	0
Improper Warrant	0
Improper Collection of Evidence	0
PROPERTY:	<u> </u>
Missing Property	0
Damage to Property	0