

City of Cleveland **Recovery Plan**

State and Local Fiscal Recovery Funds

2024 Report

City of Cleveland
2024 Recovery Plan

Table of Contents

Executive Summary..... 3
Uses of Funds 4
Promoting Equitable Outcomes..... 6
Community Engagement..... 7
Labor Practices..... 8
Use of Evidence..... 9
Project Inventory..... 10
Performance Report.....20

1. Executive Summary

As a part of the transparency and accountability requirements from the U.S. Department of the Treasury, all states, territories, cities and counties with a population that exceeds 250,000 residents that are recipients Coronavirus State and Local Fiscal Recovery Funds (“SLFRF”) are required to produce a Recovery Plan Performance Report (the “Recovery Plan”). This Recovery Plan provides information on any projects or programs funded by the City using SLFRF, how the community has been engaged in the process, how the City is ensuring program outcomes are achieved in an effective and equitable manner, and how the City is tracking and reporting programmatic success and outcomes.

The COVID-19 pandemic has profoundly shaped communities around the nation. Like many others, the City of Cleveland (the “City”) has seen substantial impacts on the health of residents, the quality of life in neighborhoods, and the overall functioning of the local economy. To help turn the tide on the pandemic, address the negative economic consequences that have resulted, and begin on the path toward a productive, substantial and equitable economic recovery, the City was allocated \$511,721,590 in SLFRF from the American Rescue Plan Act of 2021 (ARPA) of which all the funds have been deposited into the City’s accounts. This total funding amount presents a unique opportunity for the City to not only recover from the negative effects of the pandemic, but also emerge a stronger, healthier, and more equitable community.

To this end, the City has developed a comprehensive strategic framework – Mayor Justin M. Bibb’s Rescue & Transformation Plan (the “Rescue & Transformation Plan”) – for how to best utilize its SLFRF allocation, attached as Exhibit A. This framework was developed in the first and second quarters of 2022 and was put into implementation shortly thereafter. This framework is the successor to the prior administration’s RestartCLE Plan, attached as Exhibit B. As the City began its initial reopening and recovery process, the RestartCLE Plan established a framework based on three high-level, overriding principles to support decision-making about program and policy changes, as well as current and future recovery spending. These principles are to:

- Minimize the suffering and burden of the people and businesses in our community that have been impacted by the coronavirus;
- Better position all people and businesses in our community to be ready for and take advantage of the recovery; and
- Make sure all people and businesses are better off as a result of the recovery efforts we undertake so that we can become a more equitable community.

These principles guided the spending of Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act funding, as well as other stimulus funding awarded to the City, and guided the City’s decisions about how best to utilize its SLFRF allocation under the prior (Mayor Frank Jackson) administration. In transitioning from the RestartCLE Plan to the Rescue & Transformation Plan under the new (Mayor Bibb) administration, the City has set forth a systematic, data-driven, and strategic process for ensuring that expenditures of SLRF funds will address the City’s most urgent challenges. Three key components of the Transformation & Rescue Plan illustrate these features:

- The establishment of a dedicated team of City and Council staff —the Center for Economic Recovery—to work regularly with senior leaders across the administration to define strategies, create a pipeline of proposals, fully scope each initiative, objectively evaluate each initiative before recommendations are made to the Mayor or Council, and establish program evaluation tools and metrics;

- The development of 10 strategic priority areas to focus the City’s development and assessment of projects and initiatives to spend the City’s SLRF allotment; and
- The implementation of an evaluation rubric to objectively assess each proposal with the priority areas. This will ensure that each initiative (a) aligns with one of the Mayor’s strategic objectives, (b) advances and promotes equitable outcomes for underserved and underrepresented communities, and (c) is transformational.¹

This report is the third in a regular series of reports that are required under SLFRF rules. This report covers all the City’s activity through June 30, 2024 (the “Covered Period”).

2. Uses of Funds

The \$511 million of SLFRF allocated to the City represents a once in a generation opportunity to not only address the immediate fallout of the COVID-19 pandemic but will also allow the City to address some of its most pressing challenges. These funds will help the broader Cleveland community overcome the health and economic impacts COVID-19 has wrought on residents and businesses and help address some of the inequities that have been felt disproportionately by marginalized populations. During the Covered Period that fell under the previous administration, the City allocated funding to a variety of projects and initiatives to invest in based on the RestartCLE Plan:

- Public safety;
- Addressing food and housing insecurity;
- Community health;
- Lead paint poisoning prevention and abatement;
- Demolition of abandoned and blighted structures; and
- Broadband internet infrastructure and education.

After Mayor Justin M. Bibb took office, he established a new process for the City’s ARPA funding process—the Transformation & Recovery Plan. As part of the plan, the new administration launched the Center for Economic Recovery, a strategic policy team that engaged with the public, administration staff, and Cleveland City Council to shape and evaluate ideas for projects and initiatives that address the City’s most urgent challenges. The Center for Economic Recovery was responsible for equitably and strategically assessing applications for SLRF funding using uniform evaluation criteria to make strategic decisions and achieve our long-term vision.

The Center’s strategic process aimed to support transformative efforts that both provide near-term relief and result in change in an established system or practice, in perpetuity, which leads to tangible results for the residents of Cleveland. The Center for Economic Recovery was led by the Chief of Staff and consisted of senior leadership within the administration and City Council policy staff. This included: the Chief Financial Officer, Chief Government Affairs Officer, Chief Ethics Officer, Chief Communications Officer, Senior Strategist for Government Affairs and Assistant Law Director, Director of Equal Opportunity, Commissioner for the Public Health Department’s Division of Health Equity and Social

¹ This equity-focused principle is closely aligned with intent and practical application outlined in Presidential Executive Order 13985 “Advancing Racial Equity and Support for Underserved Communities through the Federal Government” which serves as the one of the bedrocks of the ARPA and SLFRF program.

Justice, Specialist for Transformative Projects, Director of Policy for City Council, and Policy Analyst for City Council. The Center's efforts were also supported by collaborators and advisors from the Fund for Our Economic Future, the Brookings Institution, and the Center for Community Solutions.

Mayor Bibb identified 10 priority areas for use of the City's SLRF allotment. These include:

1. Stabilizing the budget
2. Inclusive economic recovery
3. Housing for all
4. Violence prevention and public safety
5. Closing the digital divide
6. Modern and transparent city hall
7. Education for everyone
8. Lead-safe Cleveland
9. Arts and neighborhood amenities
10. Civic participation fund.

To accomplish actions in these priority areas, the Mayor's Center for Economic Recovery worked daily with senior leaders within the Bibb administration (chiefs and directors assigned as leads for each of the 10 priorities), Council, and the community to (1) Define strategies for 10 priority areas, (2) Create a pipeline of proposals for initiatives within each priority area, (3) Fully scope each initiative, and (4) Objectively evaluate each initiative before recommending to the Mayor and Council.

To ensure that each initiative is strategic, equitable, and transformational, the Center for Economic Recovery used an evaluation rubric to objectively assess each proposal within the priority areas. This evaluation guide includes the following criteria:

1. Strategic alignment (does this project support the achievement of one of the administration's priority areas for investment?)
2. Measurable outcomes (does the project have a clear and measurable effect on the lives of residents, with metrics to determine success?)
3. Racial equity and inclusion (does this project increase access and opportunity for the people of Cleveland in a fair, open and equitable way?)
4. Community impact (Does this initiative have a positive impact on the lives of Clevelanders by increasing their quality of life or by increasing access to jobs and opportunity?)
5. Global competitiveness and differentiation (does the project position Cleveland as a city in which to live, work or build a business? Is it unique or novel?)
6. Financial leverage and support (If this project is funded through use of ARPA dollars, are other private, public or non-profit entities committed to financially supporting the initiative?)
7. Longevity (Does this initiative prioritize long-term impact over short term gains?)
8. Environmental sustainability (Does the project help mitigate climate change and achieve sustainability goals?)

The Center for Economic Recovery advanced and recommended proposals for initiatives which receive high marks based on these criteria. Recommended initiatives, in a docket-style format, were presented to Council with a regular cadence.

Accepting and expending any portion of the City's SLRF allotment generally requires legislative authority. As of June 30, 2022, the City administration secured legislative approval to apply for and accept ARPA funds. Cleveland City Council passed ordinance 303-2021 on May 10, 2021 authorizing the Director of Finance to apply for and accept any eligible funding from the U.S. Department of Treasury

authorized under the American Rescue Plan Act, including but not limited to, reimbursing the City for any revenue losses in any given year from 2020 to 2024, and for any additional expenses incurred related to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Through this legislation, the administration has legislative authority to apply for and accept the City's SLRF allotment and apply eligible amounts to revenue replacement. The City has also secured authority to expend SLRF funds for the specific projects or programs, which will be described in greater detail in the Project Inventory section below and in future such Performance Reports.

With respect to revenue replacement (EC-6 in the allowable SLFRF Expenditure Categories), the City completed its assessment of what is needed from a revenue replacement standpoint for revenue that was lost during 2020, 2021, 2022, and 2023. Like governmental entities across the nation, the City saw a decline in revenues as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. Due to the nature of the pandemic, these declines covered a range of different types of tax revenues, as well as other types of revenue that would have been available to support government services. The SLFRF allocation is available to offset these losses.

To make its revenue replacement determination, the City utilized a template and methodology prepared by the Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA). Using this template, in 2021, 2022, and 2023 Revenue Recovery amounted to \$108,960,480, \$215,000,000 and \$140,911,000 dollars, respectively. With a particular focus on housing, safety, and jobs, revenue recovery funds bolstered the City's general fund to ensure that not only were pre-pandemic service levels maintained, but also allowed the City to deploy long-awaited innovative and creative funding solutions. The City is particularly proud of its expenditures that further enhance the safety and security of its residents: investments into efforts working to make Cleveland "Lead Safe," building capacity for the local food bank to reduce food insecurity, alleviating utility burdens, and supporting career preparing for Cleveland students.

3. Promoting Equitable Outcomes

The City has long been committed to promoting equitable outcomes through its policy and program development process. Cleveland, like many communities across the nation, suffers from the negative effects of institutionalized inequities, disparities, and racism. The \$511 million SLFRF allocation provides the City a unique opportunity to combat the existing inequities that were highlighted and exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic.

The work of the City's Center for Economic Recovery keenly focused on issues related to equity in its work. For example, the Center for Economic Recovery staff included the City's Director of Equal Opportunity and the Commissioner for Health Equity and Social Justice to ensure that the City's leaders on these topics have a voice in the discussion. Moreover, the Center for Economic Recovery's evaluation guide for SLRF-related proposals incorporated several elements that either explicitly or implicitly assess equity. For example, one evaluation criteria required an assessment of the level to which a proposal embeds and promotes "Racial Equity & Inclusion"; other evaluation criteria assessed community impact and environmental sustainability, each of which can indirectly advance equity for disadvantaged populations within the City. To help facilitate the City's work around equity, the City followed existing program evaluation methodologies used in other contexts that address critical considerations, including:

- Upfront community engagement that includes communities of color and low income populations;
- Identifying existing community and neighborhood priorities and aligning programs to them as appropriate;

- Developing qualitative and quantitative data collection and evaluation tools that can be, when possible, disaggregated to illuminate disparity;
- Identifying who will benefit from the City’s actions, and- when appropriate, who will be burdened, and- as appropriate, addressing any disparities;
- Ensuring that economic benefits, including workforce development opportunities, are available to communities of color and low-income populations; and
- Using program communications that are easily understood and accessible to anyone who could benefit from participation in the program.

This approach is evident in the City’s work, which has included extensive community engagement, which included a representative survey of over 1,600 respondents – of which more than 800 were people of color and almost 600 had incomes below \$25,000. The lessons learned through this process are incorporated into specific priorities and approaches that support community needs and priorities. Through this process, and other internal evaluations, the City identified multiple ways to target neighborhood investment to positively impact disadvantaged communities, including:

- Targeted elimination of blighting structures and brownfields that create hazards for neighborhoods and deter investment in communities;
- Implementing a cohesive approach that targets residential and commercial development to provide quality services and amenities in neighborhoods that benefit existing and new residents; and
- Investment in job creation in and near neighborhood centers and transit routes to generate good jobs in accessible locations for residents of disadvantaged neighborhoods.

The City’s economic development efforts will follow a similar focus by:

- Driving private-sector financing to support minority-owned small businesses and startup small businesses in our neighborhoods by looking at alternative forms of credit qualification and creating a pathway for businesses to access traditional capital;
- Providing wrap-around services and business support so that disadvantaged businesses can navigate barriers and access capital and contracting markets on an equal footing; and
- Eliminating barriers to contracting markets through provision of targeted financial tools that allow businesses to expand to meet market needs.

Given the pervasive and far-reaching nature of historical racism, disinvestment, and injustice, the City recognizes that progress toward equity may not be immediately realized and may take time to move the needle. Nevertheless, as noted above, the Center for Economic Recovery has a specific equity criterion that will be considered when each initiative is being evaluated for funding. Further, alongside the priority leads, community partners, and Office of Urban Analytics, the City is developing performance measure metrics to measure and clearly understand how the City’s SLRF-funded projects and initiatives have progressed equity goals.

4. Community Engagement

Under both the previous (Jackson) and current (Bibb) administrations, the City has taken a community- and resident-focused approach. This effort started with an intentional community engagement strategy to solicit input directly from residents across the City. This has been a critical part of the City’s commitment to documenting and understanding neighborhood level priorities and aligning initiatives under the broad SLFRF goals and requirements. In mid-July 2021, the City launched a multi-channel community engagement campaign designed to educate residents about the purpose of SLFRF funds and

give residents a way to share their ideas on how the City can best utilize this unique opportunity to better recover from the COVID-19 pandemic while creating a more equitable community.

To facilitate resident input, the City both launched an online citizen input tool through its municipal website and distributed printed surveys at City Hall, recreation centers, and to over 120,000 properties in the City. Through all three these collection methods, the City received 2,275 ideas. These survey results provided the City with an initial understanding of community priorities for SLFRF spending. The most commonly-cited expenditure category was Water, Sewer and Broadband Infrastructure (32% of responses) followed by Address Negative Economic Impacts, Support Public Health Response and Replace Public Sector Revenue Loss (27%, 19%, and 12%, respectively).

The survey results were synthesized to create a more detailed understanding of priorities, which indicated that public safety (19.5%) and direct services to communities and residents (10.4%) were the top two specific spending priorities. These survey results were key considerations when the previous administration and the current administration determined how the money will be allocated.

In addition, Mayor Justin Bibb's ten spending priorities were guided by recommendations that the Cleveland community set forth in the mayoral Transition Report. The transition report, published in early 2022, summarized recommendations from the Cleveland community and provided a roadmap for the administration's first 100 days and beyond. This effort was led by 80 local experts, professionals, and leaders who engaged over 500 community members – including City employees - through town halls, surveys, interviews, focus groups, and informal conversation.

In 2023, the Department of Finance held five community meetings about the General Fund Operating Budget in which the Director outlined how a city budget works with attention to how non-city funds fit into the picture. At these meetings, residents asked pertinent questions about how ARPA fits into the city budget and the Director clarified where these funds live and how they are used. These community engagement efforts have informed both the overarching priority areas and the specific initiatives which priority leads are proposing to fund through SFLRF.

On top of the outreach efforts made by the City, the legislative process required for the expenditure of funds lends itself to additional community engagement. All projects receive a public hearing in legislative committees, which are open to the public and viewable through public access television and live streaming. Members of the public may also make public comment (written or orally) at City Council meetings or on City Council's website. Numerous residents have utilized these forums to express their opinions on SLFRF expenditures, which has provided feedback on City project proposals.

5. Labor Practices

The City is well-positioned to use the projects and programs funded by the SLFRF allocation to build on its strong labor standards to promote the effective and efficient delivery of high-quality projects and programs while also supporting employment opportunities for workers. The City has multiple existing contracting requirements to support business inclusion and resident employment within the community. These requirements are applicable to strong labor standards and an equitable economic recovery of the SLFRF allocation and will be used to support such outcomes.

Existing contract goal programs are under the authority of the City's Office of Equal Opportunity (OEO). OEO is responsible for the monitoring and enforcement of the Cleveland Business Code, an ordinance that impacts Minority Business Enterprises (MBEs), Female Business Enterprises (FBEs), Cleveland Area Small Businesses (CSBs), Local Producers (LPEs), Local Sustainable Businesses (SUBEs), as well as the

Fannie M. Lewis Cleveland Resident Employment Law. This is outlined in Cleveland Codified Ordinance Chapters 187, 187A, and 188.

The foundation of OEO's work is divided into four main functions: contractor/vendor certification; pre-contract evaluation; contract compliance measurement; and contract closeout. OEO uses various standards to measure performance for different types of contracts to ensure compliance with the City's contracting goals.

As the City enters into contracts to implement SLFRF programs, with a specific emphasis on infrastructure projects or capital expenditures being pursued, as applicable, the Cleveland Business Code's contracting goals will be in place and OEO will perform its regular role in the evaluation, compliance and close-out process. Additionally, the \$511 million represents an opportunity to build capacity among local contractors – particularly those from populations that are often under-represented in the contracting process. As such, OEO will continue its work to recruit and certify new CSB, MBE, FBE, and SUBE firms.

Additionally, the City has employed community benefits agreements for multiple, larger development projects to help support the broader equity and workforce goals. These agreements have been useful tools to help drive projects to ensure that local businesses and residents derive benefits from real estate and corporate developments. Historically, the City has worked with prospective developers to support projects and guide them to meet community needs including but not limited to: employment of MBE/FBE/CSB contractors, local hiring and construction employment, engagement with Cleveland Metropolitan School District to provide job training and career pathways, and housing affordability. The City recently codified a "Community Benefits Ordinance" to ensure that these kinds of benefits come to fruition.

6. Use of Evidence

Even before the COVID-19 public health emergency and the ARPA relief package, the City employed evidenced-based intervention and program evaluation methodologies across multiple policy and program areas. Some examples of evidence-based programs implemented by the City to support its broad objectives include:

- Multiple Community Development and Economic Development programs;
- New initiatives run by the Office of Prevention, Intervention, and Opportunity for Youth and Young Adults;
- A new systematic approach to street resurfacing which has improved overall pavement condition ratings;
- The recently completed re-evaluation of the City's waste management operations; and
- The Office of Sustainability's benchmarking and LEED certification efforts.
- A nearly city-wide operational assessment with an accompanying 10-year strategic plan

Here, a similar approach is critical to the City's ability to successfully use its SLFRF allocation to effectively achieve the broad goals defined above. Investing the City's SLFRF allocation using evidenced-based policies is the most effective way to ensure dollars are used efficiently and effectively. It will allow the City to maximize the value of the investments it is making by determining what works, for whom, and how. This level of understanding will make it easier for the City to engrain improvements to outlast the one-time nature of the SLFRF allocation. The City targeted evidenced-based interventions and will use rigorous program evaluations to demonstrate programmatic effectiveness. In addition, scaling and

tweaking of current city programs (or programs in other cities) with demonstrated success may serve as helpful models for programming.

To fulfill the requirements outlined in the SLFRF, the City also leaned into programs and partnerships that are aligned with the evidence bases outlined by the US Treasury or that were well-prepared to deploy program evaluation. Many of the City's intended partners are already beholden to evidentiary standards, for example: Housing and Urban Development or US Health and Human Services. Other partners either have the analytical capacity themselves or partnerships to design and conduct rigorous studies.

In cases without evidence, projects were strategically vetted to use evaluations that produced robust information sharing frameworks and could be supported by the City's Office of Urban Analytics and Innovation (Urban AI). This approach positions the City well to advance and contribute to multiple bodies of knowledge. The approach also fits neatly with other City efforts to effectuate data-driven results.

The City identified the specific program data that would need to be collected, how it would need to be analyzed, and what can be learned from it to inform future decision-making. To ensure the most productive outcomes, specific evaluation mechanisms are unique to each project and are baked into each program design. The City used the evidence models as appropriate depending on the nature of the project and the time elapsed since the project was completed. Once the detailed uses of funds have been developed, the City will include in future Performance Reports these relevant evidence-based measures. Future such reporting therefore will include key performance indicators (KPIs) for each project. Future Performance Reports will include mandatory performance indicators for the major policy areas targeted by the City's SLFRF allocation (such as those listed in the U.S. Treasury's Compliance and Reporting Guidance at page 39), to the extent such mandatory indicators are applicable.

7. A Project Inventory-Table of Expenses by Expenditure Category

The City has evaluated and developed several specific programs and services that have received funding allocations. The cumulative expenditures to-date are listed in the table below. While many projects have been selected and legislative approval was secured, not all contracts have been executed yet; this is due to diligent and thorough municipal process. However, once a project has been approved by the legislative body, there is every intention to hold those funds for execution of said project, barring unforeseen circumstances. As contracts become fully executed, the City will update this information.

Category		Cumulative Expenditure to Date (\$)	Amount Spent Since Last Recovery Plan
1	Expenditure Category: Public Health		
1.1	COVID-19 Vaccination		
1.2	COVID-19 Testing		
1.3	COVID-19 Contact Tracing		
1.4	Prevention in Congregate Settings (Nursing Homes, Prisons/Jails, Dense Work Sites, Schools, etc.)		
1.5	Personal Protective Equipment		

1.6	Medical Expenses (including Alternative Care Facilities)		
1.7	Other COVID-19 Public Health Expenses (including Communications, Enforcement, Isolation/Quarantine)	\$3,233,968.00	(\$3,652,941.49)
1.8	COVID-19 Assistance to Small Businesses		
1.9	COVID-19 Assistance to Non-Profits		
1.10	COVID-19 Aid to Impacted Industries		
1.11	Community Violence Interventions	\$8,660,111.00	(\$142,440.00)
1.12	Mental Health Services		
1.13	Substance Use Services		
1.14	Other Public Health Services		
2	Expenditure Category: Negative Economic Impacts		
2.1	Household Assistance: Food Programs		
2.2	Household Assistance: Rent, Mortgage, and Utility Aid	\$1,474,910.53	\$1,474,910.53
2.3	Household Assistance: Cash Transfers		
2.4	Household Assistance: Internet Access Programs		
2.5	Household Assistance: Paid Sick and Medical Leave		
2.6	Household Assistance: Health Insurance		
2.7	Household Assistance: Services for Un/Unbanked		
2.8	Household Assistance: Survivor's Benefits		
2.9	Unemployment Benefits or Cash Assistance to Unemployed Workers		

2.10	Assistance to Unemployed or Underemployed Workers (e.g. job training, subsidized employment, employment supports or incentives)		
2.11	Healthy Childhood Environments: Child Care		
2.12	Healthy Childhood Environments: Home Visiting		
2.13	Health Childhood Environments: Services to Foster Youth or Families Involved in Child Welfare System		
2.14	Healthy Childhood Environments: Early Learning		
2.15	Long-term Housing Security: Affordable Housing		
2.16	Long-term Housing Security: Services for Unhoused Persons		
2.17	Housing Support: Housing Vouchers and Relocation Assistance for Disproportionately Impacted Communities		
2.18	Housing Support: Other Housing Assistance		
2.19	Social Determinants of Health: Community Health Workers or Benefits Navigators		
2.20	Social Determinants of Health: Lead Remediation	\$6,532,583.00	\$6,532,583.00
2.21	Medical Facilities for Disproportionately Impacted Communities		
2.22	Strong Healthy Communities: Neighborhood Features that Promote Health and Safety		
2.23	Strong Health Communities: Demolition and Rehabilitation of Properties		
2.24	Addressing Educational Disparities: Aid to High Poverty Districts		

2.25	Addressing Educational Disparities: Academic, Social, and Emotional Services	\$450,426.00	\$450,426.00
2.26	Addressing Educational Disparities: Mental Health Services		
2.27	Addressing Impacts of Lost Instructional Time		
2.28	Contributions to UI Trust Funds		
2.29	Loans or Grants to Mitigate Financial Hardship		
2.30	Technical Assistance, Counseling, or Business Planning		
2.31	Rehabilitation of Commercial Properties or Other Improvements		
2.32	Business Incubators and Start-Up or Expansion Assistance		
2.33	Enhanced Support to Microbusinesses		
2.34	Assistance to Impacted Nonprofit Organizations (Impacted or Disproportionately Impacted)	\$5,000,000.00	
2.35	Aid to Tourism, Travel, or Hospitality		
2.36	Aid to Other Impacted Industries		
2.37	Economic Impact Assistance: Other		
3	Expenditure Category: Public Health Negative Economic Impact: Public Sector Capacity General Provisions		
3.1	Public Sector Workforce: Payroll and Benefits for Public Health, Public Safety, or Human Services Workers		
3.2	Public Sector Workforce: Rehiring Public Sector Staff		
3.3	Public Sector Workforce: Other		
3.4	Public Sector Capacity: Effective Service Delivery		

3.5	Public Sector Capacity: Administrative Needs		
4	Expenditure Category: Premium Pay		
4.1	Public Sector Employees		
4.2	Private Sector: Grants to other Employers		
5	Expenditure Category: Infrastructure		
5.1	Clean Water: Centralized Wastewater Treatment		
5.2	Clean Water: Centralized wastewater collection and conveyance		
5.3	Clean Water: Decentralized wastewater		
5.4	Clean Water: Combined sewer overflows		
5.5	Clean Water: Other sewer infrastructure		
5.6	Clean Water: Stormwater		
5.7	Clean Water: Energy conservation		
5.8	Clean Water: Water conservation		
5.9	Clean Water: Nonpoint source		
5.10	Drinking water: Treatment		
5.11	Drinking water: Transmission & distribution		
5.12	Drinking water: Lead Remediation, including in Schools and Daycares		
5.13	Drinking water: Source		
5.14	Drinking water: Storage		
5.15	Drinking water: Other water infrastructure		
5.16	Water and Sewer: Private Wells		
5.17	Water and Sewer: IJJA Bureau of Reclamation Match		
5.18	Water and Sewer: Other		

5.19	Broadband: "Last Mile" projects		
5.20	Broadband: IJJA Match		
5.21	Broadband: Other projects		
6	Expenditure Category: Revenue Replacement		
6.1	Provision of Government Services	\$464,871,480.00	
6.2	Non-federal Match for Other Federal Programs		
7	Administrative and Other		
7.1	Administrative Expenses	\$190,740.00	(\$5,368.39)
7.2	Transfers to Other Units of Government	\$-	\$-

Loss Revenue 2021

Project [GASB2021*536]: [Loss Revenue 2021]

Funding amount: [\$108,960,480]

Project Expenditure Category: [6.1, Provision of Government Services]

Project Overview

- General Fund Budget Stabilization

Use of Evidence

- Relieve general fund stress due to overtime pay during pandemic; maintain staffing levels; ensure services are provided to all citizens

Loss Revenue 2022

Project [GASB2022*311]: [Loss Revenue 2022]

Funding amount: [\$215,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [6.1, Provision of Government Services]

Project Overview

- General Fund Budget Stabilization

Use of Evidence

- Relieve general fund stress due to overtime pay during pandemic; maintain staffing levels; ensure services are provided to all citizens

Loss Revenue 2023

Project [GASB2023*148]: [Loss Revenue 2023]

Funding amount: [\$140,911,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [6.1, Provision of Government Services]

Project Overview

- General Fund Budget Stabilization

Use of Evidence

- Relieve general fund stress due to overtime pay during pandemic; maintain staffing levels; ensure services are provided to all citizens

Auditing

Project [15190000]: [Audit]

Funding amount: (\$5,368.39)

Project Expenditure Category: [7.1, Administrative Expenses]

Project Overview

- Pay for cost of City audit, with respect to SLFRF proportions of City budget
- Charged expenditure to Internal Audit

Use of Evidence

- Ensure compliance with generally accepted accounting principles as required by the State

Lead Remediation

Project [C22618]: [Lead Safe Cleveland Investment]

Funding amount: [\$13,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.20, Social Determinants of Health: Lead Remediation]

Project Overview

- The City's \$13 million dollar investment into the Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition (LSCC) funds programming that includes: lead safe home repair grants for property owners, lead-safe certification incentives, emergency relocation assistance for households facing housing insecurity due to the presence of lead, workforce development to provide lead-abatement training and free or reduced lead services to Cleveland residents, and screening and testing for children. This investment will help secure other funds to accelerate the Lead Safe Certification process, bring much needed lead-safe home repair services to City residents (some of whom have been on waitlists for service or may not qualify for other City subsidies), and mitigate lead poisoning in children.
- LSCC is a large coalition of community members and stakeholders working to combat lead poisoning. Formed in 2019, LSCC is guided by [legislation](#) passed by Cleveland City Council that

same year. The goal of the group was to require all rental properties to register as lead safe by March 2023. Progress has been steady; however, given the challenging undertaking, public-private capacity building, and the level of community engagement required, the work will continue well into the future until we can ensure that no child is poisoned by lead in the City of Cleveland.

- https://leadsafecle.org/lead-safe-certification?gclid=Cj0KCQjwk96IBhDhARIsAEKO4xa_YARt2cy2D8jK4IUMJeTERIOrEoEMxVoLpzQJyboHq-GLwtl1Kt0aAtzIEALw_wcB

Use of Evidence

- The LSCC model is based on best practices implemented by the City of Rochester through a lead certification process. Rochester NY has been successful in reducing the rate of lead poisoning in children. <https://13wham.com/news/local/risk-of-lead-poisoning-remains-high-in-rochester-area-homes>
- The City will capitalize on the data collection and evaluation tools already deployed by LSCC for evidence and program evaluation.

Project [C22617]: [Lead Hazard Control Program]

Funding amount: [\$3,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.20, Social Determinants of Health: Lead Remediation]

Project Overview

- Support the Department of Community Development’s Lead Hazard Control Program for cost-prohibitive construction projects

Use of Evidence

- The Lead Hazard Control Program complements Housing and Urban Development (HUD) grants that also support lead remediation work. It is assumed that projects meeting HUD’s guidelines and programs would also be appropriate use for ARPA funds.

Legal Review and Financial Compliance

Project [15190000]: [Bricker & Eckler LLC]

Funding amount: [\$190,740.00]

Project Expenditure Category: [7.1, Administrative Expenses]

Project Overview

- Provide legal counsel regarding ARPA spending eligibility

Use of Evidence

- Ensure compliance with all Federal mandates for reporting

Greater Cleveland Food Bank

Project [C21601]: [Greater Cleveland Food Bank]

Funding amount: [\$5,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.34, Assistance to Impacted Nonprofit]

Project Overview

- Purchase material for the building expansion.
- To ensure that everyone in our communities has the nutritious food they need every day.

Use of Evidence

- This project is complete and facilities opened in October 2022.
 - According to quarterly data from the periods of time in which GCFB’s new facility was operational, GCFB served more clients, including more Cleveland residents than in previous, comparable quarters. While it is challenging to definitively correlate the increased funding into GCFB’s facility to increased utilization rates (due to confounding factors such as pandemic era SNAP/ EBT subsidies), the City of Cleveland is encouraged by the increased rates and will continue to monitor these positive outcomes.
- The City will capitalize on the data collection and evaluation tools already deployed by GCFB (and Feeding America) for further evidence and program evaluation.

Requested Data for ARPA: Cleveland Ward		Total People Served																							
Ward	3/15/2019 - 6/14/2019	6/15/2019 - 9/14/2019	9/15/2019 - 12/14/2019	12/15/2019 - 3/14/2020	3/15/2020 - 6/14/2020	6/15/2020 - 9/14/2020	9/15/2020 - 12/14/2020	12/15/2020 - 3/14/2021	3/15/2021 - 6/14/2021	6/15/2021 - 9/14/2021	9/15/2021 - 12/14/2021	12/15/2021 - 3/14/2022	3/15/2022 - 6/14/2022	6/15/2022 - 9/14/2022	9/15/2022 - 12/14/2022	12/15/2022 - 3/14/2023	3/15/2023 - 6/14/2023	6/15/2023 - 9/14/2023	9/15/2023 - 12/14/2023	12/15/2023 - 3/14/2024	3/15/2024 - 6/14/2024				
1	10,583	11,891	11,550	6,996	11,628	12,470	12,158	8,613	10,292	9,869	10,069	7,428	10,832	11,967	12,398	9,079	12,643	13,249	13,308	9,541	12,129				
2	14,189	14,382	15,675	10,674	13,296	14,357	15,069	11,987	11,648	11,683	12,839	9,925	14,309	14,099	14,794	12,033	16,414	16,328	17,569	13,357	15,487				
3	11,157	11,171	12,453	9,728	11,940	11,971	12,910	11,945	10,586	10,792	12,573	10,147	12,350	12,337	12,799	10,416	13,490	12,906	13,606	11,146	12,402				
4	11,352	12,738	13,055	8,653	11,984	13,016	13,173	10,389	10,185	8,906	9,828	7,881	10,909	10,919	11,891	8,375	11,508	11,992	12,984	10,518	12,205				
5	15,222	15,738	16,970	12,346	14,842	15,384	16,125	12,869	11,198	10,500	12,689	10,036	13,222	12,654	14,311	12,407	15,688	16,828	18,987	13,259	16,148				
6	12,103	12,563	13,719	9,917	13,050	14,149	15,202	12,474	11,851	10,446	11,984	9,911	12,545	13,735	14,467	11,450	14,398	14,430	15,261	11,340	13,110				
7	15,748	16,231	17,318	13,105	15,900	17,452	19,229	18,188	18,140	16,984	15,503	15,943	20,095	19,940	23,144	18,098	21,740	21,890	22,277	15,575	19,591				
8	12,286	12,854	13,509	9,920	12,574	12,710	14,733	12,153	10,754	9,721	12,374	10,368	13,811	14,595	15,552	13,054	16,162	16,593	16,222	13,124	15,337				
9	16,144	17,885	19,206	12,807	16,556	16,782	18,857	15,013	15,728	13,336	15,299	12,558	15,759	14,671	17,661	14,026	17,386	17,870	19,297	13,307	17,004				
10	13,814	13,918	14,992	10,768	15,213	13,776	16,016	13,004	12,130	11,297	12,731	10,260	14,473	14,960	17,261	13,877	16,165	16,545	17,238	12,684	15,563				
11	13,968	14,082	14,447	11,041	15,041	16,135	16,861	13,559	12,200	11,332	11,850	10,868	14,480	13,888	15,647	12,245	16,568	16,998	19,424	15,304	17,853				
12	13,208	13,964	14,906	10,750	13,047	15,390	17,160	13,802	12,350	11,987	14,000	11,253	14,011	14,104	16,424	13,376	15,478	15,719	16,711	13,128	15,045				
13	9,111	9,769	10,174	7,555	9,701	14,428	14,169	11,925	10,722	10,374	11,174	10,216	12,819	12,461	13,319	10,767	13,168	13,222	14,839	10,840	13,393				
14	21,847	22,641	25,958	19,952	22,831	25,678	28,683	21,416	19,517	18,752	22,651	18,200	22,716	22,772	24,482	19,661	23,935	25,103	27,298	21,354	23,237				
15	12,362	13,041	13,726	10,681	13,057	14,202	15,577	13,958	13,169	12,966	13,625	12,423	15,566	15,475	15,219	13,116	15,907	17,071	17,618	14,058	15,625				
16	8,150	9,754	10,166	7,523	10,541	11,854	12,527	9,835	8,385	8,298	9,162	8,370	10,587	10,844	12,211	9,508	12,210	12,788	13,347	10,731	12,766				
17	4,262	4,296	4,661	3,689	4,270	5,777	6,091	5,176	4,728	4,027	4,319	3,672	5,513	5,378	5,879	4,648	6,220	6,655	6,482	4,747	5,322				
City of Cleveland Total	216,506	226,728	242,485	176,085	224,771	245,531	264,540	216,306	203,583	191,270	216,670	179,459	233,997	234,799	257,453	206,136	259,180	265,587	282,468	214,313	252,217				
Outside of Cleveland	222,182	235,767	236,426	190,388	224,520	311,085	293,522	247,474	237,597	218,189	235,643	211,540	266,432	284,655	297,291	248,076	299,909	327,133	331,019	264,373	303,390				
Grand Total	438,688	462,495	478,911	366,473	449,291	556,616	558,062	463,780	441,180	409,459	452,313	390,999	500,429	519,454	554,744	454,212	559,089	592,720	613,487	478,686	555,607				

Note: Between 6/15/23 and 6/14/24, about 3% of the households served had addresses that could not be located with certainty. Those households are not included in these counts.

Public Safety Investments

Project [C21603]: [Police]

Funding amount: [\$4,842,003.92]

Project Expenditure Category: [1.11 (Community Violence Interventions)]

Project Overview

- Purchase of equipment and upgrades to emergency operation centers that better allow law enforcement to respond to crime and violence.
- Includes: Helicopter upgrades, bicycles + bicycle uniforms and gear, riot gear, technological upgrades, various vehicles

Use of Evidence

- This investment seeks to increase the capacity and efficiency of public safety forces, improve response times, and more effectively solve crime and other safety concerns.

Project [C21603]: [Fire]

Funding amount: [\$2,454,939.08]

Project Expenditure Category: [1.7 (Other COVID-19 Public Health Expenses)]

Project Overview

- Purchase of equipment and upgrades to emergency operation centers that better allow the Fire Force to respond to emergencies.
- Includes: Technological upgrades, training gear, clothing, tools, and facilities/ capital upgrades

Use of Evidence

- This investment seeks to increase the capacity and efficiency of public safety forces, improve response times, and more effectively solve fire-related concerns.

Project [C210604]: [EMS]

Funding amount: [\$779,028.92]

Project Expenditure Category: [1.7 (Other COVID-19 Public Health Expenses)]

Project Overview

- Purchase of equipment and upgrades to emergency operation centers that better allow the Emergency Medical Services to respond to emergencies.
- Includes: Equipment, tools, ambulances

Use of Evidence

- This investment seeks to increase the capacity and efficiency of public safety forces, improve response times, and more effectively solve health-related concerns.

Project [C21606]: [Safety IT]

Funding amount: [\$3,818,107.08]

Project Expenditure Category: [1.11 (Community Violence Interventions)]

Project Overview

- Purchase of surveillance equipment such as security cameras and routers

Use of Evidence

- This investment seeks to increase the capacity to monitor crime, as well as allow law enforcement to more efficiently and effectively respond to violent crime

Greater Cleveland Career Consortium

Project [C23670]: [Greater Cleveland Career Consortium]

Funding amount: [\$2,100,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.25 (Addressing Educational Disparities: Academic, Social, and Emotional Services)]

Project Overview

- In late 2021, Cleveland Metropolitan School District launched the PACE program, which supports students seeking a meaningful career by providing career planning, internship/ work experiences, and career advising. CMSD's PACE Program is supported by the Greater Cleveland Career Consortium, a nonprofit entity that facilitates collaboration between the school district, youth-focused organizations, and regional employers.

Use of Evidence

- The PACE program is novel in nature. It was designed over an 18-month process by a group of dedicated school professionals, employers, and community partners who believed that early and intensive exposure to careers would better prepare students for in-demand jobs upon graduation.
- The Greater Cleveland Career Consortium is tasked with monitoring and recording program outcomes, such as number of students enrolling in career programs, students obtaining employment, and connecting to job providers. While some initial program results have emerged, many indicators of success will be lagging: some results may not be evident until students have matriculated and if they are in their early years of schooling, it could be some time before a complete and accurate picture of the outcomes are clear.

Utility Assistance

Project [C23652]: [Utility Assistance]

Funding amount: [\$2,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.2 (Household Assistance: Rent, Mortgage, and Utility Aid)]

Project Overview

- This program offers a one-time amnesty benefit to residents who are serviced by Cleveland Water or Cleveland Public Power that are behind on their utility bills and are on a payment plan.
- Eligible recipients are those who experience and can certify that one or more of the following applies to them: unemployment, behind on rent/ mortgage/ utility bills, or have an annual household income below 300% of the federal poverty level.
- This program is being rolled out in 3 phases and is expected to be completed by the end of 2024.

Use of Evidence

- Residents who lost their jobs and/ or experienced financial hardship as a result of COVID-19 were also more likely to experience difficulty paying utility bills, especially low-income residents

in Cleveland who already face utility burdens. Alleviating utility bills will ensure greater financial stability for residents.

Integrated Health Initiative

Project [C23671]: [Integrated Health Initiative]

Funding amount: [\$3,746,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.25 (Addressing Educational Disparities: Academic, Social, and Emotional Services)]

Project Overview

- Ensure that every CMSD scholar has access to integrated physical and mental health services to help every student successfully manage the pandemic’s disruptions by: 1. Outfitting all participating schools with the supplies needed for a medical cart and equipment including cold storage for vaccines, medical supplies, and/or a private room available and equipped for telehealth and mental health appointments; 2. updating the technology needed for telehealth appointments, and building secure and soundproof spaces to utilize telehealth; 3. Adding “brick and mortar” clinic spaces in strategic areas of the district so they can serve the school they are located in as well as additional people in the surrounding area; and 4. Engaging the community and raising awareness of the initiative by utilizing earned and targeted mass and social media, participating in key community events, and creating clear and succinct outreach materials.
- This project is expected to break ground in late 2024.

Use of Evidence

- It is well established in the scientific community that children are best prepared to learn when they are healthy, and high-quality, readily accessible mental and physical healthcare is needed to fully support healthy child development.
- This is especially true for Cleveland students, where many families struggle to meet basic needs, as outlined in the report, “[Education Forward](#).”

Birthing Beautiful Communities

Project [C22653]: [Birthing Beautiful Communities]

Funding amount: [\$1,000,000]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.21 (Medical Facilities for Disproportionately Affected Communities)]

Project Overview

- Building of a standalone birthing center in a predominantly black neighborhood to provide care to expecting mothers in support of healthy pregnancies and birth outcomes.
- This capital project is expected to break ground in late 2024.

Use of Evidence

- Cleveland has one of the highest infant mortality rates in the country, as well as an extreme racial disparity within that mortality rate. See 2021 report [here](#).
- Wraparound services, including prenatal care/ support and supportive birth spaces have been shown to improve birth outcomes and maternal health.

Woodhill Choice Affordable Housing

Project [C22616]: [Woodhill Homes II LLC]

Funding amount: [\$4,919,291]

Project Expenditure Category: [2.15 (Long-term Housing Security: Affordable Housing)]

Project Overview

- Building of 500 new housing units in a predominantly black neighborhood, in addition to parks/ recreational facilities, retail, and early childhood education center.
- This project is expected to close in late 2024.

Use of Evidence

- This development project was also supported by a \$35 million dollar grant from HUD through a competitive selection process.

Performance Report

Greater Cleveland Career Consortium

The specific key performance indicators (KPIs) are: 1. the number of CMSD graduates matriculating into a post-secondary program of student for a specific job sector, 2. the number of CMSD graduates directly entering the workforce in a specific job sector, 3. PACE program completion rates and 4. The number of employer partners involved in the PACE program. These KPIs should be able to inform whether this program is successfully preparing and enabling students to enter the workforce.

While the program spans multiple years for students, early reporting indicates some success: in the 2022-2023 school year, 303 students were accepting into degree or training programs and 174 students reported a job placement. Program completion rates continue to improve quarter over quarter, and the number of employers involved in the program has increased from 86 to 145 in the past school year.

Utility Assistance

The specific key performance indicators (KPIs) are the number of residents who have received amnesty, the amount of amnesty given to residents, and the number of letters sent to potentially eligible program participants. This program has three phases and two phases are complete as of March 2023; the third phase should be completed by the end of 2024.

Current reporting indicates that 2,652 letters were sent in phase one and 1,409 letters were sent in phase two. For residents with outstanding electricity bills, the average amnesty amount was \$721.59; for residents with outstanding water bills, the average amnesty amount was \$652.69. Through the

completion of phase two, 1,210 residents with outstanding electric bills and 922 residents with outstanding water bills received amnesty for a total of \$1,474,910.53 in amnesty.

Greater Cleveland Food Bank

The specific key performance indicators (KPIs) are the improvements to the Greater Cleveland Food bank building, which includes a new community distribution center. This will expand storage for dry food and increase partner distribution. As to output and outcome measures: In the 20 month period prior to the new facility being built (December 2020 to September 2022, the Greater Cleveland Food bank served 1,476,084 residents of the City of Cleveland; from September 2022 to current (June 2024), GCFB served 1,737,354 residents of the City of Cleveland. Despite relative economic improvement since the peak of COVID-19, food access continues to be a persistent issue Cleveland and the new facility is supporting GCFB's ability to fill a critical need in the community.

Lead Safe Cleveland

The City of Cleveland's investment into Lead Safety through the Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition can, in many ways, be tracked through LSCC's Dashboard, which monitors poisoning rates, certification rates, and resources dispersed: https://povertycentercle.github.io/lsccl_dashboard/

The City also tracks the performance of its \$13 million investment in the LSCC. Despite unforeseen delays in contracting and implementation, this program has seen early successes in number of lead-safe certification incentives distributed and a projected 25 lead-safe home repairs completed by end of July 2024. LSCC has also received a transfer of over 200 home repair applications from another non-profit partner, most of which are in the inspection phase. Looking forward, the City and LSCC are collaborating on contract amendments to streamline programming and incentivize lead-safe certification incentives and home repair grants.

As of the end of quarter 1 in 2024, LSCC and its partners have served at least 100 unduplicated persons or business entities and provided 442 financial incentives for the city's lead safe certification. This program has also built out the necessary workforce by funding 20 lead-safe workers to be approved for contracting, who are expected to repair at least 65 homes this year. As for future work, this funding will support relocation assistance for families that must move as a result of lead hazards and continue to build out the contractor workforce.

For the \$3 million Lead Hazard Control Program, eight units have received lead abatement services to date and there are eleven units with pending construction dates. These jobs would not have been completed but for the funding and flexibility afforded by ARPA funds. The program has certified contracts with three lead abatement contractors and expects to contract with at least eight more contractors. These contractors are expected to service more than 310 high-cost jobs in the next 24 months.

Public Safety Police

The specific KPIs are the purchase of equipment and vehicles for Community Violence Interventions and Public Health. The Division of Police purchased 27 desktop computers to help fill gaps in basic patrol and detective units. As to output and outcome measures, these computers allow the officers to enter reports including supplemental reports, enter evidence items especially gun information, check to see if there are any warrants or criminal history of the subject and to complete their daily duties in an efficient manner for proper record keeping. Funding was allocated for the Real Time Crime Center, which includes the enhancement and installation of 38 video surveillance cameras throughout the City of

Cleveland. The specific KPIs are the cameras installed in high pedestrian and vehicle traffic areas. These funds will help purchase an additional 266 surveillance cameras at new locations. Expanded capacity through vehicles and equipment, as listed above, allowed the Division to deploy a number of violent crime reduction initiatives, such as 2 district-specific details each month, social media reporting to track criminal behavior, and the highly successful wheels down initiative. Continuing downward trends from 2022, in 2023 the Cleveland Division of Police reported statistical decreases in Part 1 crimes of homicide, rape, robbery, burglary, and theft.

Public Safety Fire

The specific KPIs are the purchase by the Cleveland Division of Fire of 20 Microsoft surface pro tablets to support the field inspection and code enforcement duties of the Fire Inspectors. As to output and outcome measures, this allows the inspectors to be more efficient and spent more time in the field at various location. The Division estimates protecting more than \$90,000,000 dollars in property value due to force's efforts. The Division of Fire also invested in technological upgrades and equipment to improve the force's efficiency, leading to improved average response times.

Public Safety Emergency Medical Service

The specific KPIs are the purchase by the Division of Emergency Medical Service (EMS) of 21 medical cots to be utilized to transfer and transport sick/injured persons from their home to the ambulance and then to the hospital emergency department; and the purchase of 45 cardiac monitors, which are utilized as a diagnostic tool to treat and care for critical medical and trauma patients while on the scene of a medical emergency and while transporting the patient to the hospital emergency department. The Division also ordered 18 new ambulances, 7 of which were received and immediately put into use. In 2023, the Division of EMS received 120,017 calls for service and transported over 73,676 patients to area hospitals.

Exhibit A

Transformation & Rescue Plan:

Mayor Bibb's Rescue & Transformation Plan

OVERVIEW

In 2021, the City of Cleveland received the eighth largest allocation of American Rescue Plan & Recovery Act (ARPA) funds, totaling \$512 million over two years. The City received half of these dollars in Fall 2021 and will receive the remainder in Summer 2022.

Mayor Bibb's Rescue & Transformation Plan outlines a priorities and process for maximizing the use of federal funds including ARPA, the Infrastructure Innovation and Jobs Act (IIJA) and other legislation still under development that is expected over the next few years.

Center for Economic Recovery

A key part of Mayor Bibb's plan is the launch of the Center for Economic Recovery, a strategic policy team that will engage with Cleveland City Council to shape and evaluate ideas for ARPA-funded projects that address our most urgent challenges.

The Center for Economic Recovery will equitably and strategically assess applications for ARPA -funding using the same evaluation criteria to make strategic decisions to achieve our long-term vision.

PRIORITIES

Mayor Bibb's Rescue & Transformation Plan identifies ten priorities for federal funding that will make an impact on the everyday lives of Clevelanders.

Stabilizing the Budget

ARPA-funds were primarily intended to assist cities with revenue replacement that was lost due to the impacts of COVID-19.

Inclusive Economic Recovery

We're moving away from managing decline to making investments that drive growth in Cleveland's neighborhoods that have been overlooked or excluded in the past.

Housing For All

Affordable housing and investments that drive wealth creation and homeownership.

Violence Prevention & Public Safety

A comprehensive approach to public safety invests in initiatives that address the root causes of violence and crime. We must invest in proven programs focused on proactive intervention and prevention.

Closing the Digital Divide

Thirty percent of residents don't have internet or reliable Wi-Fi or broadband services. We're committed to making targeted investments to close the digital divide and make internet access more affordable and accessible.

A Modern & Transparent City Hall

Residents of Cleveland deserve a responsive City Hall that embraces the best practices in constituent engagement. Achieving this requires investment in new technologies, services and process improvements.

Education for Everyone

From newborns to adult learners, from students to CEOs, improving education is the foundation of our future. We must support learning at all ages, inside and outside the classroom to improve literacy rates, college and work readiness.

Lead-safe Cleveland

Cleveland is facing a lead crisis. Nearly 90% of our housing stock was built before lead paint was outlawed. We must put a stop to this public health emergency and make properties lead-safe to ensure no more children are impacted by the dangers of lead exposure.

Arts & Neighborhood Amenities

Cleveland is a city on the rise and our arts, recreation, parks, cultural treasures and other amenities should reflect that.

Civic Participation Fund

Cleveland's 17 wards can identify important neighborhood projects and advocate for change at the hyper-local level in partnership with City Council.

PROCESS

Cleveland Economic Recovery Plan Process

EVALUATION PRINCIPLES

The Center for Economic Recovery will evaluate all requests for funding based on the same set of evaluation principles to ensure all decisions are made strategically, equitably and transparently. In addition to the principles outlined below, the Center will use an Evaluation Guide to assess and evaluate funding requests.

Strategic Alignment

Does this project support the achievement of one of the administration's priority areas for investment?

Measurable Outcomes

Does the project have a clear and measurable effect on the lives of residents with metrics to determine success?

Racial Equity & Inclusion

Does this project increase access and opportunity for the people of Cleveland in a fair, open and equitable way?

Community Impact

Does this initiative have a positive impact on the lives of Clevelanders by increasing their quality of life or by increasing access to jobs and opportunity.

Global Competitiveness & Differentiation

Does the project position Cleveland as a city in which to live, work or build a business? Is it unique or novel?

Financial Leverage & Support

If this project is funded through use of ARPA dollars, are other private, public or non-profit entities committed to financially supporting the initiative?

Longevity

Does this initiative prioritize long-term impact over short term gains?

Environmental Sustainability

Does the project help mitigate climate change and achieve sustainability goals?

Exhibit B

Restart CLE Plan



ReStart CLE

*CLEVELAND CORONAVIRUS
STRATEGIC RECOVERY PLAN*

MAY 2020

CITY OF CLEVELAND
MAYOR FRANK G. JACKSON



CITY OF CLEVELAND
Mayor Frank G. Jackson



INTRODUCTION

Governor DeWine's April 27th order creates a framework for the gradual reopening of the State of Ohio and our economy. As we begin to reopen our local economy, it is important to remember that this pandemic is far from over and the risk posed by the coronavirus remains very real. Opening up our economy will increase our interaction with one another, which will increase the probability of infections and fatalities in our community. It is imperative that we, as a community, continue to act responsibly to protect the health of our residents.

If done right, this gradual reopening gives us opportunity to contain the spread of the coronavirus and restart our local economy safely. In order to safely and successfully do this, we must move forward with a thoughtful strategic plan, and faithfully implement and execute its components. If we do this, this recovery will make us stronger as a community – physically, economically, and socially – and the City of Cleveland will be positioned for a better recovery that is sustainable and benefits all residents and businesses.

As we began this recovery planning process, we engaged experts from Cleveland State University and our local medical institutions and made a deliberate choice to build from a health and medical perspective in order to protect those at risk from the coronavirus and then incorporate economic and social support to help the people and businesses who need assistance.

OUR STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK

To support this approach and the implementation of this plan, we made, and will continue to make, all decisions about programs and policy changes, as well as current and future recovery spending, will be based on three high-level, overriding principles:

- We will minimize the suffering and burden of the people and businesses in our community who have been impacted by the coronavirus;
- We will better position all people and businesses in our community to be ready for and take advantage of the recovery; and
- We will make sure all people and businesses are better off as a result of the recovery efforts we undertake so that we can become a more equitable community.

WHAT WE ARE DOING TO HELP

Based on these principles, we are focusing on two broad categories of tactics designed to meet our residents' and businesses' most immediate needs and position them for long-term success:

1. Continuing to implement measures that limit the spread of the coronavirus, and
2. Mitigating the short-term social and economic impacts of the coronavirus.

As we put this into practice, we have multiple programs, policies and efforts to support each one. These involve policy decisions directly under the control of the City of Cleveland, as well as allocation of funds obtained through the initial Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security (CARES) Act and other sources. While these represent initial actions, the efforts we are taking represent an infrastructure that can be scaled to meet additional needs and adequately align additional resources in the future.

CONTINUING TO PREVENT THE SPREAD OF THE CORONAVIRUS

If our overarching goal is to make Cleveland as safe and healthy as possible, we must, first, accept and acknowledge that simply because our economy is reopening, the pandemic is not over. Now is the time when we have to double-down on the things we are already doing to prevent the spread of the coronavirus. If we do not make this commitment, everything we have put in place to address the economic and social aspects of this pandemic will be a waste of time and money.

The coronavirus has spread in our community quickly. Cleveland's first case was reported on March 14th. Within a week it had increased to 24. One week later it was 92. Yesterday, we had 770 confirmed cases. Our first fatality happened on March 29th. Yesterday, we had 34. This growth has occurred with stay-at-home orders in place, and as restrictions are removed, it will accelerate if we do not take appropriate measures. Because of this, we have developed a health-first approach to our strategic response that includes extensive public education, multiple prevention activities, and swift intervention when a problem arises. This requires that we build out a multi-faceted approach to protecting people.

“ This growth has occurred with stay-at-home orders in place, and as they are removed, it will accelerate if we do not take appropriate measures. ”

UNDERSTANDING WHERE RISK FOR CONTAGION AND MORTALITY IS HIGH

Three factors are critically important in understanding where elevated risk exists – age, density, and underlying health issues. These three factors make urban centers, such as Cleveland, particularly susceptible. Recent research combined data from the US Census Bureau and the Centers for Disease Control and

Prevention to develop a model of relative risk based on proximity, age and prevalence of underlying health issues. Based on this, they identified Ohio's 100 highest risk large city census tracts – 49% of which are located in the city of Cleveland. We are using this model as a baseline for our own efforts, and are adding our own data and information to create a fuller understanding of where people are most at risk. This combined data serves as the basis for our education and monitoring programs.



AGE



DENSITY



UNDERLYING
HEALTH ISSUES

ON-THE-GROUND, REAL-TIME EDUCATION AND MONITORING

Without universal testing and a vaccine, the coronavirus will continue to be a chronic problem. Governor DeWine recently announced a plan to significantly increase testing across the State over the next several weeks and our local medical institutions will play a significant role in the continued increasing of testing capabilities. The Cleveland Department of Public Health is working with our local medical institutions to develop a plan where, as much as possible, expanded testing initially targets at-risk populations based on the above referenced model. In order to expand on these protective efforts, we will launch several additional initiatives.

1. Public Health Education Campaign – It is imperative that, as the economy reopens, we consistently communicate with residents and businesses that the pandemic is not over. In order to do this, we will build out a public education campaign. This campaign will focus on several key messages, including:

- The risk from the virus remains very real and individuals can make a difference;
- How the coronavirus is transmitted;
- Simple steps residents and businesses can take to protect themselves; and
- What to do if you have symptoms.

This campaign will utilize multiple modes of contact to ensure that we are casting as broad a net as possible. It will include:

- Outreach through our Departments of Public Health, Aging, Community Development, and others;
- Phone calls;
- Public Service Announcements;
- Social media and other digital tools;
- Print materials; and
- Other available avenues.

2. Direct Prevention Support with At-Risk Populations – In addition to the educational materials and critical messaging outlined above, there will be expanded prevention support that addresses the unique nature of those at-risk. These activities include, but are not limited to:

- Identifying and partnering with medical directors of long-term care facilities and hospitals;
- Reviewing facility specific infection prevention and control plans as requested;
- Reviewing facility PPE availability and, if inadequate, linking them to resources who can provide it; and
- Leveraging partnerships with medical institutions to support testing of at-risk populations.

3. Expanded Community Outreach Staff – In order to support the education and prevention efforts previously described, we will work with multiple partners and scale up our own abilities. Earlier this year, we hired 14 Community Engagement Healthy Homes Initiative specialists to work out of our Department of Community Development. This group will serve as one of the City’s community outreach teams. We are also reassigning a group of employees who are not currently working in essential functions to expand our ability to directly engage residents. These employees will be trained on safe engagement practices and key health messaging. We anticipate training employees over the next couple of weeks.

CONTINUATION OF PERSONAL PROTECTION ACTIVITIES AND SOCIAL DISTANCING

As stay-at-home orders are lifted, we still need social distancing and preventative measures. This means following rules that are in place to protect yourself and others:

- Stay at home unless it is absolutely necessary to go out;
- If you do have to go out for essential reasons, maintain proper social distancing and wear a mask;
- and Wash your hands regularly.

Additionally, it is important to work with our business community so that, as they reopen in accordance with the Governor’s approach, they ensure customers can access their services safely and their employees can work in a safe fashion so they do not contract the virus and take it home to their families.

ON-GOING INTERVENTION ACTIVITIES

Without a vaccine, with an increase in testing and the reopening of the economy, there will be a surge in infections. This leads to two considerations that must be addressed. The first is continuing to identify methods for isolating individuals who test positive but do not require hospitalization, and the second is how to increase contact tracing capabilities.

Our Department of Public Health is working with our local medical institutions, property owners, and others to identify intervention strategies that will help us mitigate the impact of infections as they are identified, including:

- Continuing initial outreach and contact tracing for all positive cases in the city of Cleveland;
- Working with long-term care facilities to link them with providers of needed medical supplies; and
- Connecting facilities that have infections to ODH training modules on infection prevention and control.

” It is important to work with our business community so that, as they reopen in accordance with the Governor’s approach, they ensure customers can access their services safely and their employees can work in a safe fashion so they do not contract the virus and take it home to their families. ”

MITIGATING THE SHORT-TERM SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC IMPACTS

People and businesses of Cleveland have been hurt economically and socially by the coronavirus. Primarily, the coronavirus has created two major economic and social problems:

1. Small businesses have been closed or have significantly limited customers resulting in lower than expected revenue; and
2. Many people are unemployed, putting them at risk of not being able to afford their rent, buy food, pay their utilities and any number of other negative effects.

PROVIDING ASSISTANCE/SUPPORT TO BUSINESSES THAT HAVE CLOSED OR ARE AT RISK OF CLOSING

The economic downturn that has resulted from the coronavirus has been swift, and the impact has been felt very quickly by businesses. Many businesses have had to temporarily cease operating or have had to dramatically alter their business operations.

Based on this, we are launching three new programs to support small business operations through the reopening and recovery of the economy. These programs will utilize multiple funding streams and result in over \$10 million of investment to support local businesses.

1. Restoration Working Capital Program (\$5.5 million)

– This program is open to large (more than 30 employees) and small businesses to assist with eligible costs including:

- Accounts receivable;
- Rent/mortgage payments;
- Utilities; and
- Payroll.

Businesses can receive low interest loans of:

- Up to \$100,000 for large businesses;
- Up to \$25,000 for small businesses; and
- Additional resources are available through our EDA Working Capital Loan Program for companies with additional need.

“ The economic downturn that has resulted from the coronavirus has been swift, and the impact has been felt very quickly by businesses. ”

Eligible businesses must demonstrate impact from the coronavirus on cash flow or revenue. Preference will be given to entities that are unable to access other coronavirus-related capital, able to retain and/or restore pre-coronavirus employment, and that show a substantial negative impact on revenues. Additional criteria and conditions may apply.

2. Emergency Working Capital Program (\$3 million) – The City is currently implementing this program which is open to small businesses to assist with working capital needs such as:

- Rent/mortgage payments;
- Utilities; and
- Payroll.

Businesses can receive low interest loans of up to \$10,000 with deferred repayment until January 2021. Eligible businesses must demonstrate impact from the coronavirus on cash flow or revenue. Preference will be given to entities that are able to retain and/or restore pre-coronavirus employment, and that show a substantial negative impact on revenues. Additional criteria and conditions may apply.

3. Emergency Working Capital Program – Specially Impacted Businesses (\$2 million) – This program is open to restaurants, personal care businesses and storefront retail establishments to assist with working capital needs such as:

- Rent/mortgage payments;
- Utilities;
- Payroll; and
- The purchase of personal protective equipment.

Businesses can receive low interest loans up to \$20,000 of which up to 50% (\$10,000) is forgivable for costs associated with the purchase of personal protective equipment. Eligible businesses must demonstrate:

- The impact from the coronavirus on cash flow or revenue; and
- They must be a locally-owned small business.

Preference will be given to entities that are unable to access other coronavirus-related capital, able to retain and/or restore pre-coronavirus employment, and that show a substantial negative impact on revenues. Each business will also be required to provide a business sustainability plan which outlines how they anticipate changing and re-orienting their business in response to the changes in operations. Additional criteria and conditions may apply.

PROVIDING ASSISTANCE/ SUPPORT TO PEOPLE STRUGGLING WITH BASIC NEEDS

Over the past six weeks, more than 30 million Americans have filed for unemployment. In Ohio, this pattern has held with weekly new claims far exceeding the totals from the peak of the late 2008 financial crisis. Early data from the Bureau of Labor Statistics suggests that this is being acutely felt in service-based jobs, and, anecdotally, this lines up with what we are hearing from local businesses.

These impacts, based on the structure of the labor force in Cleveland, are likely to be more acutely felt here. A disproportionate share of Cleveland residents have jobs where, based on the nature of the work, it is more difficult to practice preventative measures such as working from home and social distancing while at work. This puts these individuals at greater risk for permanent and temporary job loss.

We are already starting to see the effect of these job losses in Cleveland. Based on data from the United Way's 2-1-1 helpline, there is an immediate need to provide support and services that address our residents' basic needs, including rental assistance, food, utility assistance, homeless outreach and other referral services. For example, during the first three weeks of the coronavirus crisis, the United Way saw a 250% increase in people requesting rental

assistance over the same period last year – a problem that will likely increase as the pandemic continues. As a result, our strategic approach has several programs to meet these challenges. These programs will be funded by the City and administered through partner organizations.

” A disproportionate share of Cleveland residents have jobs where, based on the nature of the work, it is more difficult to practice preventative measures such as working from home and social distancing while at work. This puts these individuals at greater risk for permanent and temporary job loss. ”

We will use multiple funding streams that result in approximately \$18 million of investment to support residents. Because these programs will use HUD funding, we will go through an expedited process that involves public comment on our plan. These programs are:

1. Rental Assistance (\$11.3 million) – This is the largest category of assistance available to residents because this is where, outside of food assistance which has an established network of providers, we are seeing the largest increase in calls for service.

Rental assistance has the ability to have a significant impact in two ways. First, it will provide immediate relief to individuals on the verge of eviction. Our goal is to prevent residents from becoming homeless as a result of the coronavirus. Cleveland City Council, under the leadership of Council President Kelley, successfully negotiated a moratorium on evictions with the Housing Court. This is an important part of the effort to combat this problem. Second, it will provide assistance to small landlords who have deferred rent payments from tenants during this pandemic. There are three sources of funds available to address the immediate and short-term housing needs of individuals impacted by the coronavirus.

The City will partner with agencies who have experience providing short term emergency rental assistance. The agencies will work with residents to determine how much assistance they require for up to 90 days. This money is targeted to individuals without income. In order to maximize the effect of this money, it will require monthly recertification of individuals who have returned to work or have obtained unemployment benefits.

“ We will use multiple funding streams that result in approximately \$18 million of investment to support residents. Because these programs will use HUD funding, we will go through an expedited process that involves public comment on our plan. ”

2. Basic Needs Assistance (\$4.25 million) – Basic needs support includes funding to assist residents through:

- Food banks,
- Food delivery,
- Utility assistance,
- Senior service;
- Homelessness outreach; and
- Referrals to other services.

We will partner with agencies who have experience running these types of programs, and this will allow us to leverage additional funding and assistance.

3. Special Needs Assistance (\$2.5 million) – This funding targets individuals who are homeless and those with HIV/AIDS. Cuyahoga County Homeless Service has an effective infrastructure to assist our homeless population. These services, however, have seen immediate cost increases due to the coronavirus and our funding will support their existing efforts. Activities under this category include, but are not limited to:

- Deconcentrating of shelters through the renting of hotel rooms;
- Increases to sanitation costs and port-o-let rentals;
- Increased staffing costs due to hazard pay; and
- Increased costs to quarantine individuals with compromised immune systems.

4. Broadband Assistance (\$500,000) – With CMSD school buildings closed, students are being asked to complete online learning activities. Nearly two-thirds of CMSD families do not have internet connectivity, which negatively impacts a student's ability to complete these activities. CMSD is investing over \$2.4 million to address this access issue in the near-term. We are working in conjunction with CMSD and DigitalC on a longer term solution by investing \$500,000 to reach 1,000 CMSD households. This investment will support the backbone infrastructure, household equipment, and devices necessary for students to access and complete their online learning activities.

KEEPING CLEVELAND SAFE

In closing, our goal is to make Cleveland as safe and healthy as possible, and we want to remind everyone that this pandemic is not over. The risk of infection remains very real. Now is the time when we have to double-down on the things we are already doing to prevent the spread of the coronavirus. As we reopen the economy, it is critical that everyone takes the appropriate precautions to protect themselves, their family, their neighbors, and everyone else they come into contact with. This means:

- Stay at home unless it is absolutely necessary to go out;
- If you have to go out, maintain proper social distancing and wear a mask;
- Wash your hands regularly; and
- If you do test positive or are in close proximity to someone who is positive, follow the directions of the Cleveland Department of Public Health – most importantly stay home.

