CIVILIAN POLICE REVIEW BOARD

CPRB MEMBERS

OFFICE OF PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS

October 10, 2023 **MEETING MINUTES**

The times reflected in the minutes are a reflection of the time on the YouTube video

THE NEXT CPRB BOARD MEETING IN ROOM 514 AT CITY HALL

OPS

M Ke Da Sh Br <i>M</i>	Ily Sharp, Chair like Hess, Vice Chair en Mountcastle ave Gatian nerall Hardy randon Brown lichael Graham nenoa Miller iana Cyganovich	Art Bowker, I Vincent Funa Hercules Har Joe Szymansi Susan Lanma Kristen Traxlo Jermaine Sm	z, Administrator Investigator iri, Interim Sr. Investigator ris, Investigator ki, Investigator in, Investigator er, Investigator ith, Investigator , General Manager
<u>LEGAL COUNSEL</u> Lillian Hall		BOLD: IN ATTENDANCE	
I. II. III.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES PUBLIC COMMENT NEW BUSINESS		Billy Sharp
IV.	PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS		Marcus Perez, Administrator
V.	OPS REPORT		Marcus Perez, Administrator
	A. REVIEW OF CHIEF DISCIPLINARY DE	CISIONS	Marcus Perez, Administrator
VI.	POLICY UPDATES		Marcus Perez, Administrator
VII.	COMMITTEE REPORTS		
VIII.	UNFINISHED BUSINESS		
IX.	ADJOURNMENT		

I. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 9:05 A.M. (5:42)

ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS: 9:06 A.M. (5:45)

- II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 26, 2023 minutes held in abeyance to add training.
- III. PUBLIC COMMENT (NONE)
- IV. PRESENTATION OF INVESTIGATIONS: (NO COMPLAINANTS PRESENT)
 - 1. 2023-0009: P.O. Matthew Dickerson #786 (7:28-12:12)

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: *Sustained* Motion: Diana Cyganovich

Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Carried

P.O. Luis Florez-Galarza #800

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Diana Cyganovich

Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Carried

Motion by Mike Graham for a Group I Letter of Re-Instruction for P.O. Matthew Dickerson and P.O. Luis Florez-Galarza for Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct. 2nd by Kenneth Mountcastle. Motion carried.

2. 2023-0057: P.O. Samuel Ortiz Jr. #1694 (12:39-19:44)

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion Carried

P.O. Jason Santana #2012

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion Carried

P.O. Alex Parente #1221 (RETIRED 8-8-23)

Chair Sharp questioned if the complainant stated she didn't need a supervisor on the scene was it caught on WCS? Investigator Lanman stated that it was caught on Officer Santana's WCS that the complainant asked for a Sargent. Officer Santana explained the steps he was taking to get her the information she needed. He stated that he didn't know if she was going to get another answer. The complainant stated that she was trying to buy time until someone came to pick up her daughter.

3. 2023-0008: Det. Mark Jelenich #2504 (20:21-37.23)

Allegation: Improper Search Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Mike Hess Motion: Carried

Allegation: Improper Arrest
Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Mike Hess Motion Carried

P.O. Thomas Schwartzhoff #443

Allegation: Improper Search Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Mike Hess Motion Carried

Member Hardy stated that she did hear officers offer the complainant a plea bargain, asking if he wanted to be an informant. Investigator Szymanski stated that that information was not captured on WCS. Chair Sharp stated this officer did the right thing and questioned was the crack/cocaine ever tested. Member Graham stated the case was indicted. The preponderance of the evidence shows that officers were consistent with GPO 2.02.02

4. 2022-0317: Sgt. Dina Gulley #9326 (37:55-48:17)
Allegation: Lack of Service/Failure to Investigate

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Member Hardy questioned if attempts were made to reach the complainant. Investigator Lanman stated three emails were sent with no response from the complainant and she didn't have information whether or not any phone calls were made. Sr. Investigator Funari stated that this is actually Investigator Szymanski's case and requested that he answer Member Hardy's questions. No other information was provided from the complainant other than the name Chad. The complaint form was filled out via the OPS website. Complainant didn't leave his last name or a contact phone number. Vice-Chair Hess states that without video or audio recording of the phone call or any other supporting evidence from the complainant, the preponderance of the evidence cannot be established.

5. 2023-0016: Sgt. Michael Keane #9198 (1:20:34-1:27:50)

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Ken Mountcastle Abstain: Mike Graham Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Ken Mountcastle Abstain: Mike Graham Motion: Carried

Chair Sharp states that there was no WCS and there's no way to determine one or another if the statements were made given in the investigator's report.

6. 2023-0040: Sqt. Alexander Sinclair #9313 (1:28:17-1:41:18)

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Mike Graham Abstain: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Billy Sharp

Second: Mike Graham Abstain: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

Member Hardy questioned why Investigator Szymanski wasn't presenting his own cases. Sr. Investigator Funari answered that he didn't think an investigator should have to present more than five cases because that's a lot to prepare for. Also, the investigators were in a training for 40 hours the week prior. There was dialog amongst the board members regarding the six month time line when presenting cases.

7. 2023-0056: P.O. Braden Jarrell #2076 (49:00-1:19:54)

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess

Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion: Carried

P.O. Branden Sylvester #2203

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess

Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion: Carried

Sgt. Charles Boddy #9254

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess

Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

Complainant Statement: (54:15-56:00) Complainant states that her son does have a medical diagnosis and has a history of suicidal ideation. Complainant stated that she believes that her son's statements were coerced by her sister, who he lives with, but doesn't have custody of. During a phone conversation with the complainant, the police advised her that they couldn't make an illegal entry into the home unless they had proof that her son was injured or in danger.

Chair Billy Sharp questioned if when the police arrived on scene, did they explain that they couldn't just go in without probable cause, was there anything that should have sent a flare off? Investigator Szymanski answered the responding officers arrived on scene to speak to the complainant's sister, she wouldn't answer the door and told them to get off of her porch. There was dialog amongst Investigator Szymanski and board members regarding this call being labeled a CIT call. Member Cyganovich questioned if Investigator Szymanski investigated the complainant's son's social media and he stated that he did.

8. 2023-0077: P.O. Christopher Bosak #57 (1:50:31-2:12:27)

Allegation: Lack of Service/Failure to Investigate

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Michael Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded Motion: Michael Graham Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Carried

P.O. Molly Madaras #1754

Allegation: Lack of Service/Failure to Investigate

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Michael Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded Motion: Michael Graham Second: Billy Sharp

Motion: Carried

Board member Graham motion that the preponderance of the evidence, along with body camera footage and a lack of a follow-up report shows that a Lack of Service did occur. Member Graham motioned for a Group I Violation-Letter of Re-Instruction for violating GPO 5.05.01 (How to Handle Domestic Violence protocol) for Officer Madaras and Officer Bosak. 2nd by Member Hardy. Motion carried.

9. 2023-0090: P.O. Jordan Tipton #1591 (2:47:56-2:56:00)

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Sherall Hardy Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

P.O. Daniel Gaviria-Buena #1590
Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Sherall Hardy Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

Member Hardy motioned for a Group I Violation-Letter of Re-Instruction for Officer Tipton for his unsatisfactory performance.

10. 2023-0092: Sgt. Michelle Gricar #9262 (2:56:50-3:16:22) Allegation: Failure to Provide Name and Badge Number

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Michael Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion: Carried

Allegation: WCS Violation Recommendation: Unfounded Motion: Michael Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded Motion: Michael Graham Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

P.O. Thomas Harrigan #1085

Allegation: Lack of Service/Failure to Provide Name and Badge Number

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Michael Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

Allegation: WCS Violation Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Sustained Motion: Michael Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

Allegation: Excessive Force Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

P.O. Hector Vazquez #1203 Allegation: WCS Violation

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

P.O. Niccolo Angelino #720 Allegation: WCS Violation

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Diana Cyganovich

Motion Carried

Member Graham motioned for a Group I violation for the Lack of Service allegation against Officer Harrigan for violation of Manual Rule 4.13 and a Group I violation for being discourteous and rude against Officer Harrigan.

11. 2023-0083: P.O. Kevin McLain #2136 (3:37:18-3:54:13)

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

Allegation: WCS ViolationRecommendation: Sustained

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

P.O. Brian Taylor #2067

Allegation: Lack of Service/Response Time

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

Allegation: Lack of Service/Failure to Investigate

Recommendation: Sustained

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion Carried

Based on the preponderance of the evidence, Chair Sharp motioned for a Group I violation for the WCS violation against Officer McLain who was in violation of GPO 4.06.4. Chair Sharp Motioned for a Group I violation against Officer Taylor for his unsatisfactory performance.

12. 2023-0070: P.O. Nathan Dawson #940 (TABELED)

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation:

Motion: Second: Motion:

Sgt. Alexander Sinclair #9313

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation:

Motion: Second: Motion:

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Chenoa Miller

Motion: Carried

13. 2023-0023: P.O. Jovan Larkin #1056 (4:10:42-4:19:35)

Allegation: Improper Arrest

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Motion carried

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Insufficient Evidence

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Carried

P.O. Lamar Heath #817

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Billy Sharp Motion: Carried

P.O. John Sanderson #733 (Resigned)

Member Hardy stated this case happened in 2011 and questioned why it took so long to hear this case. Investigator Harris stated that the complaint was filed on February 6th, 2023. Member Hardy questioned if there is a time line/limit for the cases to be heard. Investigator Harris states that OPS will always investigate the complaint no matter how much time has lapsed. Chair Sharp asked if there was a reason that the complainant took 12 years to file this case. Vice-Chair Hess stated that Officer Heath was consistent with Manual Rule 5.09 and other CDP policies and procedures.

14. 2023-0179: P.O. Cory Beckwith #1363 (4:04:30-4.09:58)

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Chenoa Miller Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Bias Free Policing

Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Chenoa Miller Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Member Miller states based on the preponderance of the evidence including WCS Footage and Officer Beckwith was in compliance with Manual Rule 5.09.

15. 2023-0123: P.O. Matthew Woznicki #2508 (3:54:52-4:03:00)

Allegation: Improper ArrestRecommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

Allegation: Excessive Force Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess

Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

P.O. John Ogle #415

Allegation: Excessive Force
Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

Det. Daniel McCandless #364

Allegation: **Excessive Force**Recommendation: Exonerated

Motion: Mike Hess Second: Ken Mountcastle

Motion: Carried

Vice-Chair Hess states that the preponderance of the evidence which includes WCS footage of the encounter and statements from the complainant, indicates that the alleged conduct, which was the arrest of the complainant for OVI did occur. The arrest was supported by probable cause based on the complainant's behavior.

16. 2023-0129: P.O. Seth Mercer #868 (2:12:58-2:33:18)

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Lack of Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

P.O. Derick Brown #713

Allegation: Unprofessional Behavior/Conduct

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Mike Graham Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Member Graham states the preponderance of the evidence to include the WCS footage shows the conduct did not occur.

17. 2023-0146: P.O. Delvonte Scott #1349 (2:33:56-2:47:17)

Allegation: Lack of Service
Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

P.O. Kaitlyn Adkins #948

Allegation: Lack of Service/No Service

Recommendation: Unfounded

Motion: Billy Sharp Second: Sherall Hardy Motion: Carried

Chair Sharp states officers were in accordance with 4.01, 4.05, 4.18 and the WCS footage shows that the complainant's actions led up to his own arrest.

V. OPS REPORT: The CPRB voted to appeal the Chief's decision for OPS case 2021-0255 to The Director of Public Safety.

New Business: (4:21:00-5:05:58) there was discussion amongst the board regarding the resignation of Investigator David Hammons. Member Hardy questioned if Investigator Hammons was getting paid during the time he was the Interim Sr Investigator. Administrator Perez said that information was relayed to HR the very next day after he had the discussion. Member Mountcastle questioned has there been a resolution to the case. Chair Sharp stated to hold off on that discussion, because it was something that was discussed in Executive Session. Member Graham states he doesn't think that "accept" is the correct word. Also stating that they can just acknowledge receipt of the resignation letter from Investigator Hammons. Member Graham motioned to accept the resignation letter of Investigator Hammons, 2nd by Member Hardy. Motion carried.

There is discussion as to CPRB meetings being held virtual December, January, February and possibly November (since three board members will be attending the NACOLE Convention in November). Motion made by Member Mountcastle to have the November meeting in person and the December, January and February meetings remotely, 2nd by Member Miller. Motion carried.

Administrator Perez updated the board regarding the CIT training stating that CDP officers receive 40 hours CIT training during their time in the academy. They then receive 12 hours yearly as an annual refresher training and then for in-service training, they'll receive eight hours of training covering PTSD, Suicide and Drug Addiction. OPS Investigators received 40 hours training last week and will receive 12 hours continuous training.

Administrator Perez gave an update on who takes a detective's cases when he's on a medical leave or on vacation stating that decision is left up to the division supervisor

of that section. It's at the discretion of the supervisor to reassign it to someone else.

Administrator Perez gave an OPS update stating we're looking at about 245 open investigations and we're starting to work on the disposition letters stating that there were a couple of individuals who never received disposition letters and were never notified the case was being heard by the CPRB, which has caused some frustration on their part and rightly so. There are about 99 of those disposition letters that have to go out that have not gone out since 2022. An administrative assistant has been hired to help the CPRB Secretary. We will do the notifications, but we do owe the public an apology. As these cases were being heard, individuals weren't being notified to be able to come to the CPRB meetings. Administrator Perez stated that we were negligent in our duties to be able to inform Mrs. Toth and give her the opportunity to come speak in front of the board. Administrator Perez wants to go on record that he'll be writing an apology letter to Mrs. Toth and send it to Chair Sharp for his endorsement. Chair Sharp requests that Administrator Perez keep the board updated on the numbers as they come down until they get to zero.

Member Miller questioned if there is going to be a letter submitted to the public offering a formal apology from the board to provide transparency. Administrator Perez stated the website is currently being updated and the content will be able to be managed. Chair Sharp stated that anyone can view the meeting online.

CPRB Private Secretary Grimes stated that she didn't want the board to be left with the statement that was made by Administrator Perez stating that she personally spoke with Mrs. Toth and that she explained to her what our situation was. Mrs. Toth has been notified on numerous occasions. A couple of occasions, Toni called her personally and she has spoken to her about the letter that she was calling about. Private Secretary Grimes stated Mrs. Toth had two different dates mixed up when she spoke to her personally.

Mrs. Toth is stating that she wasn't notified of the meeting, but Mrs. Shanks called her personally so we do get notifications to the complainants. Whether they respond to us or they decide not to show up at the last minute, that's on them. Private Secretary Grimes reiterated that she didn't want the CPRB to be left with the thought that we're not notifying the complainants, because we are. Chair Sharp thanked Private Secretary Grimes for her comment.

Chair Sharp stated that the board is aware of the backup, not because of anything that Private Secretary Grimes did. Chair Sharp states that he would prefer that Administrator Perez present his final closeout with Mrs. Toth. Private Secretary Grimes informed Chair Sharp that the beginning of any complainant's disposition letter begins with "we apologize for taking so long for your disposition".

OLD BUSINESS (5:06:10-5:20:16): Member Hardy states that Administrator Perez said he would check on education training for people that are not going to the NACOLE convention in Chicago, stating that we'll be at the end of the 4th quarter in November and December 2023. Administrator Perez stated that the person that does the training (Commander Maguth) doesn't come back until next week and once he comes back, they

will sit down and discuss the calendar year 2024 in order to put some things on the calendar during the CPRB meeting. Member Hardy asks if there will be any training this year and states she can contact someone and see what they want to be trained in if necessary. There was discussion about the CPRB budget being one percent of CDP's budget. Administrator Perez stated that the training budget is about \$36,000 of which only \$12,000 has been used.

Chair Sharp stated that he thought Member Hardy wanted information brought back from the NACOLE conference, but he now understands that she wanted training for board members not attending the conference.

Chair Sharp questions where the board was on the new manual. Administrator Perez stated that he had meetings scheduled for the next day, but deferred Chair Sharp's question to legal representative, Lillian Hall. Miss Hall states that Administrator Perez wasn't able to attend the previous meeting. There were some questions that needed to be hash out with him and a few other people, but they are making progress. Chair Sharp requests a full report for the November meeting.

There was discussion on whether or not Member Hardy can ask a questions about cases that were already discussed and ruled on. Chair Sharp requests that the questions be held until the next meeting so he can get clarity on what can or cannot be asked after a case is heard. Member Hardy read information contained in the CPRB operating manual regarding recognizing employees and police officers for their work. Member Hardy asks how many investigator positions are open and Administrator Perez responded four.

Member Hardy asks why there wasn't an African/American woman being interviewed for a position and questions if any applied! Administrator Perez responded that the most qualified candidates are interviewed and that he sends those resumes to the board for their review and that the board chooses the candidate.

IX. ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn the meeting by Member Chenoa Miller. 2nd by Member Sherall Hardy (5:20:25). Motion carried.